

Minutes of the February 7, 2014
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Members Present: Jean Kessloff, Eric Monroe, Bill Freytag, Lance Rom, Sally Shelton, Shawn Krull, Clancy Kingsbury, and Alternates Jody Speck and Doug Jones

Members Absent: None

Others Present: Sarah Hanzel, Kip Harrington, Jeanne Nicholson, Brett Limbaugh, Patsy Horton, Michelle Dennis, Scott Sogge, Bob Brandt, Leah Brown, Kel Arguello, Chad McDonald, Dave Lyons and Brad Estes, City Council Liaison

Krull called the meeting to order at 7:30 a.m.

Approval of the Meeting Agenda

Krull requested that an item, Work Session, be added under New Business.

Shelton moved to approve the agenda with the noted addition. The motion was seconded by Rom and carried unanimously.

11.1 Reviews

1012 12th Street (14RS002)

Sogge reviewed the request and identified the fire damaged area. He added that the rear roof slope and plane will not be changed and that the fascia and overhang will remain intact. He further explained that the ceiling joists and structural elements in the fire area will be replaced as needed.

Rom moved to recommend a finding that removing and replacing roof framing post fire, replacing existing asphalt shingles and repairing existing windows will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 1012 12th Street. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

1103 West Boulevard (14RS003)

Brandt reviewed the request and identified the windows that are being proposed to be replaced during the current remodel project. He noted that the clapboard siding has been replaced with vinyl siding. He explained that the outside trim on the windows will stay the same and that all of the windows will be replaced with more energy efficient windows over the next couple of years.

Freytag moved to open discussion on the 11.1 Review for 1103 West Boulevard. The motion was seconded by Rom.

Kessloff asked if the property owner has considered rehabilitating the windows.

Brandt advised that the current windows cannot be replaced with double panes, the pulleys don't work and cannot be replaced and that some of the windows do not open. He added that it would be too expensive for the property owner to rehabilitate the windows.

Kessloff stated that the Secretary of Interior Standards do not recommend vinyl windows and that windows should be replaced with in kind windows. She added that replacing the windows with vinyl windows could have a cumulative effect and could compromise the contributing status of the house.

Brandt informed the Commission that all of the windows were wrapped with aluminum when the vinyl siding was installed. He added that the wood inside trim will stay the same and that the permit for the siding was previously approved by the Historic Preservation Commission.

Monroe stated that the muntin bars are defining features and inquired as to whether they will be emulated in the new windows.

Brandt responded that the manufacturer has stated that the muntin bars can be matched exactly.

Freytag reviewed the Building Permit process and reminded the applicant to be aware of the Building Permit expiration date so that a new permit does not need to be obtained and approved by the Commission for the remaining windows. Freytag briefly explained the appeal process in the event that the State does not approve the vinyl windows.

Brandt advised that a couple of years ago, the addition was removed and replaced and that new windows were installed in the addition at that time.

Freytag moved to recommend a finding that replacing the original double hung windows with matching double hung vinyl windows will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 1103 West Boulevard. The motion died due to a lack of a second.

Rom moved to recommend a finding that replacing the original double hung windows with matching double hung vinyl windows will have an adverse effect on the historic property located at 1103 West Boulevard. The motion was seconded by Kessloff and carried with Kessloff, Monroe, Rom, Shelton, Krull and Kingsbury voting yes and Freytag voting no.

1725 9th Street (14RS004)

McDonald informed the Commission that the old wood siding was rotten and that he is proposing to replace it with hardboard textured siding. He added that the same siding has been used on the neighboring houses.

In response to a question from Freytag, McDonald advised that the siding is eight inch lap siding and that he is unsure what was previously on the house.

Kessloff stated that this is a minimal traditional house and that it did not have drop lap siding on it. She added that it would have had ribbon course siding that was probably cedar. She expressed concern that replacing the siding with hardboard siding could compromise the contributing status of the structure. She suggested that the owner replace the siding with ribbon course siding instead of lap siding. She noted that the scalloped trim was a defining feature to the structure and suggested that the trim be put back on the house.

McDonald reminded the Commission that the surrounding homes have the same siding on them and that he can put the scalloped trim back on the house. He inquired if a new application will need to be submitted to replace the bathroom window.

Krull asked if the window replacement can be added to this application and included in the Commission's motion.

Freytag expressed his opinion that the window replacement could be included in the motion. He encouraged the applicant to install an era correct ribbon course siding on the house.

Kessloff commented that the house is small and plain and that the ribbon course siding and the scalloped trim are architectural features of minimal traditional homes.

Kessloff moved to recommend a finding that replacing the wood siding with LP Smartside siding applied in ribbon course and the replacing of the scalloped trim with fabricated material will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at be 1725 9th Street. The motion was seconded by Freytag and carried with Kessloff, Monroe, Freytag, Shelton, Krull and Kingsbury voting yes and Rom voting no.

1423 9th Street (14RS005)

Legner reviewed the photographs of the garage and noted that the garage is old and unstable. He added that they are proposing to raise the structure and put in a new floor to address drainage and stability issues. He explained that if the structure is stable, it will be placed on the new foundation in the same location and that an addition would be added to the front of the structure. He added that the old part would be a workshop and the addition would be used as a two car garage. He advised that the new garage doors would match the existing doors on the structure.

In response to a question from Freytag, Legner reviewed the dimensions, the elevation and the height of the garage.

Freytag asked if the existing siding will be used on the structure. Legner stated that the current siding is different than the house and that he would like to put new eight inch cedar siding on the garage to match the house. A brief discussion followed regarding the dimensions of the proposed garage.

Kessloff reminded the Commission that the garage is a contributing structure and that the proposed changes may affect the status of the structure. Kessloff asked if the applicant has considered rehabilitating the structure with the same dimensions which would be adequate for a garage.

Legner responded that he would like to have some workshop space in the garage.

In response to a question from Krull, Legner advised that the contractor is confident that the structure can be raised and placed back down on a new foundation.

Kingsbury stated that this would be a substantial increase to the size of the garage and asked if the neighbors support the proposed addition. Legner informed the Commission that he has visited with the neighbors and they are not opposed to the addition.

Kessloff stated that the proposed addition would elongate the garage and suggested that a separate building be built in front of the existing garage. Additional discussion followed.

Kessloff moved to recommend a finding that raising the existing garage and adding on to the garage using matching materials and matching the neighbor's garage height will have an adverse effect on the historic property located at 1423 9th Street. The motion died due to a lack of a second.

Freytag moved to recommend a finding that raising the existing garage and adding on to the garage using matching materials and matching the neighbor's garage height will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 1423 9th Street. The motion died due to a lack of a second.

Krull asked if four inch lap siding could be used on the entire structure and that a delineation be made between the old structure and the addition.

Legner responded that he did not prefer to have a delineation between the older structure and the addition.

Monroe explained that this is a contributing structure and suggested that some kind of delineation from the old to the new needs to be apparent to help in preserving the status of the structure. He added this can be done many different ways such as using different materials, changing direction, changing setbacks or roof lines, etc.

Legner asked what happens if the contractor determines that the garage is too unstable to be raised and that it will need to be removed in order to build a new garage.

Krull advised that the removal of the structure would be an adverse effect on the property. Additional discussion followed.

Freytag suggested that the 11.1 Review be continued until it is determined if the garage can be lifted to allow for the construction of a new foundation and for the applicant to provide a site plan proposing an offset for the addition and a description of the materials that will be used on the garage.

Freytag moved to continue the 11.1 Review for 1423 9th Street to the February 21, 2014 meeting. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

Approval of the Minutes

Shelton moved to approve the January 3, 2014 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Rom and carried unanimously.

New Business

Election of Officers

Kessloff nominated Shawn Krull for Chairman. The nomination was seconded by Freytag. Shelton moved for nominations to cease for Chairman. The motion was seconded by Rom and Krull was unanimously elected Chairman.

Rom nominated Eric Monroe for Vice Chairman. The nomination was seconded by Shelton. Rom moved for nominations to cease for Vice Chairman. The motion was seconded by Shelton and Monroe was unanimously elected Vice Chairman.

Freytag nominated Jean Kessloff for Secretary. The nomination was seconded by Rom. Kessloff nominated Sally Shelton. Shelton declined the nomination. Monroe moved for nominations to cease for Secretary. The motion was seconded by Shelton and Kessloff was unanimously elected Secretary.

Home Show – March 28-30, 2014

Hanzel reminded the Commission of the upcoming Home Show and provided a copy of the previous year's equipment list and the signup sheet to the Commission.

RFP – Resurvey West Boulevard Historic District

Hanzel informed the Commission that the Request for Proposals for the Resurvey of the West Boulevard Historic District was approved by City Council and that it has been sent out to consultants and has been posted on the City's website. She noted that the RFP's are due by noon on February 18, 2014.

HPC Response to Communications Tower

Hanzel reviewed the letter to Terracon regarding a proposed cell phone tower that was drafted by Rom. Krull suggested that this be a standard letter the Commission uses in response to structures being constructed in the Historic District.

Shelton moved to use this letter as a standard response letter for structures being constructed in the Historic District. The motion was seconded by Rom and carried unanimously.

Rom asked if the letters could be submitted to the Commission members prior to meetings. Discussion followed regarding electronic communications with Commission members.

Subcommittees

Property Nomination Subcommittee

Krull asked for volunteers to serve on this subcommittee. Kessloff and Shelton volunteered.

Design Guidelines Subcommittee

Krull informed the Commission that we need to move forward with the Design Guidelines. He added that the contract has been negated and that they will need to be rewritten. He asked for volunteers to work on the Design Guidelines. Monroe volunteered to work with Rom and Kessloff on the Design Guidelines. A brief discussion followed.

West Boulevard Photo Project and the Streamlining Subcommittees

Krull stated that these subcommittees are no longer needed and they can be removed from the list.

Website

Krull reported that the consultant is waiting on the Design Guidelines and the Project Professionals List. He asked for volunteers. Freytag volunteered to serve on the subcommittee with Krull. Horton requested that staff and the Commission be provided the proposed layout of the website. Horton briefly reviewed the grant funds that have been spent and the grant funds that are available for future work on the website. Additional discussion followed.

Work Session

Horton advised that the Commission needs to schedule a work session for the upcoming grant request. A brief discussion followed and a decision was made to hold the work session on February 26, 2014 at 4:00 p.m.

Limbaugh informed the Commission that he has visited with the Mayor about hiring a consultant to look at the consolidation of the Historic Preservation Commission and the Historic Sign Review Committee. He added that the Scope of Services will consist of reviewing the existing processes to ensure the applications are being reviewed in a timely and efficient manner, reviewing staffing needs and include recommendations for the Design Guidelines. He added that he will share the Scope of Services with the Commission at the next meeting. He noted that funding for the project will be determined after the Scope of Services is reviewed.

Kessloff asked if the subcommittee should move forward with the Design Guidelines. Krull responded that the lack of a full Commission has delayed work on them. Freytag suggested that the subcommittee move forward on the Design Guidelines and that the subcommittee work with the consultant once the contract is approved.

Hanzel asked for volunteers to review the Request for Proposals for the Resurvey of the West Boulevard Historic District on February 18, 2014 at 2:00 p.m. Krull, Kessloff and Freytag volunteered.

Kessloff informed the Commission that the Parks Department is repairing the concrete slab of the original power plant across from the creek in Founders Park and that their intent is to install history markers at this location.

Horton reviewed the procedures for the alternates. She noted that if any of the seven members are absent or have a conflict of interest with a particular item, then Alternate 1 can vote. If two or more members are absent, then both alternates can vote. She added that the Chairman needs to identify the alternates at the beginning of the meeting and that the alternates can comment but are not able to vote if all members of the Commission are in attendance.

There being no further business, Freytag moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:54 a.m.