

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
February 19, 2010

MEMBERS PRESENT: Pat Roseland, Jean Kessloff, Tamara Pier, Shawn Krull, Duane Baumgartner, John Wagner

OTHERS PRESENT: Bob Evans, Robert Martin, Randy Foss, Kristen Allgauer, Steve Achtien, David Lang, Cecilia Lang, Eileen Burkholder, David Viall, Bill Kessloff, Marcia Elkins, Karen Bulman, Sharlene Mitchell

Call To Order

Roseland called the meeting to order at 7:36 a.m.

710 Kansas City Street (10CM007)

Evans presented the request to replace the thirteen windows for energy efficiency purposes. Foss indicated that the existing steel casement windows would be replaced with double pane fiberglass noting that the mullion dividers are located between the glass panes. Foss indicated that the interior granite sills would not be disturbed.

Baumgartner moved to recommend a finding that the replacement of thirteen windows in various locations with the new windows replicating the existing windows on the property located at 710 Kansas City Street will have no adverse effect on historic property. Pier seconded the motion.

In response to a question from J. Kessloff, Foss indicated that a wood window style is required to achieve true divided lights noting the financial impact of the upgrade. J. Kessloff expressed concern with the loss of visual integrity resulting from the dividers placed between the glass panes. Discussion followed regarding the visual integrity of the divided light windows and the financial expense required to upgrade the window style.

Evans addressed the minimal impact the proposed window design will have on the visual integrity of the street view noting that the new windows will improve maintenance and energy efficiency issues. Evans stressed that the Church is a non-profit organization and must consider the financial expense.

Elkins stated that the structure is located in the environs of the Downtown Historic District noting that the focus of the 11.1 Review is the effect of the proposed changes on the surrounding historic district.

In response to a question from Krull, Foss indicated that the technology for external mullions is currently not available. In response to a question from Wagner, Viall commented on the available window designs and suggested approving the installation of one window to assist the Commission in determining the visual impact of the proposed window design.

Evans stated that the structure is in the environs noting that all the windows, with the exception of the stain glass windows, will be replaced. Evans stated that the proposed design will not be a radical change to the structure's physical appearance. Martin identified the adjacent business uses. Discussion followed regarding the visual impact and financial expense of the window project. Evans addressed the extensive research completed by the Trustee Board.

In response to a question, Viall indicated that external extrusions are not available at this time.

Discussion followed regarding the impact the window project will have on the character of the building and the neighborhood. Krull suggested that when the technology is available that the Church consider adding the external extrusions.

J. Kessloff complemented the Church for their efforts to upgrade and maintain the building noting her support for adding the external extrusions when they are available. In response to a question from J. Kessloff, Evans indicated that the financial expense would be a determining factor to the addition of external extrusions.

The motion to recommend a finding that the replacement of thirteen windows in various locations with the new windows replicating the existing windows on the property located at 710 Kansas City Street will have no adverse effect on historic property carried unanimously.

804 St. Joseph Street (10CM008)

Allgauer presented the request to repair the interior water damage to the walls and ceiling and to remove a wall between the interior spaces. Achtien indicated that the wall being removed is a non-load bearing partition which would allow 804 and 806 St. Joseph Street to be combined.

Wagner moved to recommend a finding that the repair of the water damage to the walls and ceiling and removal of the wall partition between 804 and 806 St. Joseph Street on the property located at 804 St. Joseph Street will have no adverse effect on historic property. Krull seconded the motion.

In response to a question from J. Kessloff, Achtien indicated that the partition wall is early 1970's vintage and contains no historic elements. In response to a question, Achtien identified the location of the partition wall to be removed.

The motion to recommend a finding that the repair of the water damage to the walls and ceiling and removal of the wall partition between 804 and 806 St. Joseph Street on the property located at 804 St. Joseph Street will have no adverse effect on historic property carried unanimously.

913 West Boulevard (10RS001)

D. Lang presented the request for exterior alterations to the property to facilitate the interior remodel of the kitchen and sunroom. D. Lang addressed the extent of the interior remodel noting that period materials, tiles and woods would be utilized. D. Lang addressed the relocation of several windows, the roofline realignment and the addition of a deck on the 1970's addition of the home.

D. Lang addressed the south elevation alterations noting that the deck materials will match the wood work on the rest of the home. D. Lang addressed the relocation of the existing two south elevation windows to better accommodate the interior kitchen design. D. Lang indicated that the home was remodeled into a duplex in the 1970's resulting in the current west elevations. D. Lang indicated that the proposed alterations would realign the roofline and replace the dormer window with a double hung window to match the rest of the home. D. Lang identified the northwest elevation windows that would be removed and replaced with more period style windows.

Krull moved to recommend a finding that the relocation and replacement of five window openings related to the kitchen and laundry room areas, the back entry remodel, the

addition of a door and deck to the south elevation and roofline alterations on the property located at 913 West Boulevard will have no adverse effect on historic property. Baumgartner seconded the motion.

D. Lang addressed the efforts being taken to restore the property as historically and aesthetically correct as possible. In response to a question from Krull, D. Lang indicated that the south and west elevation windows will be new Pella wood exterior historical windows.

Discussion followed regarding the alterations to the roofline. In response to a question from Wagner, D. Lang indicated that the original slope of the roof will not be altered.

Wagner expressed his concern with the visual impact of the side yard deck. Extensive discussion followed regarding alternative designs to the proposed deck.

Wagner indicated that moving the two south elevation windows together will alter the visual appearance of the property. J. Kessloff indicated that the paired window design is not standard for the architectural design of the home. J. Kessloff acknowledged the impact the interior design has on the exterior façade stressing the need to maintain the illusion of a historic façade.

J. Kessloff suggested moving the deck to the west elevation or replacing the deck with a stair/patio combination.

In response to a question from Krull, D. Lang indicated that they had not purchased any materials for the project. Discussion followed regarding the design of the south elevation, the decking materials and the obtrusive design of the second story deck on the adjacent property.

Elkins called attention to the Secretary of the Interior Standards with regard to the proposed alterations to the 1970 vintage addition. Elkins stressed that the Standards specify that additions complement, not replicate, the structure, that there be a distinction between the addition and the original structure and that the addition be removable. Elkins indicated that the applicant has done an excellent job of meeting the Secretary of the Interior Standards and encouraged approval of the request.

C. Lang addressed the alternative deck designs considered noting that a west elevation deck is not possible due to interior obstructions and that the patio/stair proposal is obtrusive and less functional. C. Lang addressed the efforts to balance function and aesthetics. C. Lang addressed the removal of landscaping and fencing that had previously blocked the view of the south elevation and indicated that fencing or landscaping could be installed if that was necessary to screen the deck from view from West Boulevard. Discussion followed regarding the application of the Secretary of the Interior Standards to the 913 West Boulevard request.

Wagner moved to amend the motion to address the alterations to the historic structure and alterations to the 1970 addition in separate motions. J. Kessloff seconded the motion.

D. Lang indicated that the roof line alteration is critical to the entire process and requested that the Commission act on this request individually.

The motion to address the alterations to the historic structure and the alterations to the 1970 vintage addition in separate motions failed with J. Kessloff and Wagner voting Yes and Roseland, Pier, Krull and Baumgartner voting No. (Vote 2 to 4)

The motion to recommend a finding that the relocation and replacement of five window openings related to the kitchen and laundry room areas, the back entry remodel, the addition of a door and deck to the south elevation and roofline alterations on the property located at 913 West Boulevard will have no adverse effect on historic property carried with Roseland, Pier, Krull and Baumgartner voting Yes and J. Kessloff and Wagner voting No. (Vote 4 to 2)

Approval of Agenda

The following items were added to the agenda

- McGillicuddy House Letter of Appreciation
- Training Session Update

Baumgartner moved, Krull seconded and carried unanimously to approve the Agenda as amended.

Approval of Minutes

Baumgartner moved, Pier seconded and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of the February 5, 2010 meeting.

Treasurer's Report

Bulman reviewed the report noting that there have been no changes.

McGillicuddy House Letter of Appreciation

Wagner moved, J. Kessloff seconded and carried unanimously to request that staff prepare a Letter of Appreciation to Abrahamson and his class for their work on the McGillicuddy House restoration.

Training Session Update

Elkins provided a draft agenda for the March 2, 2010 Training Session noting that the Commission should meet with Dennis and Nelson prior to the 7:00 p.m. slide show presentation. Elkins recommended that the slide show be open to the general public noting that the notification mailing would include the owners of all of the historic properties and environs and a press release would be provided to all of the news media. In response to a question, Bulman addressed the funding available for the mailings.

Krull moved, Pier seconded and carried unanimously to approve the expenditures for the March 2, 2010 slide show presentation mailings.

Individual Nomination Project

Bulman indicated that the State Historic Preservation Office has advised Dennis that the Fairground barn would be eligible for nomination but that the Alfalfa Palace may not be eligible for nomination.

Bulman recommended transferring the National Register funding to the workshop line item to allow an educational speaker to be brought in for the May Preservation Month activities. Discussion followed regarding reallocation of the National Register funding and the request of funding for a National Register nomination project in the 2010-2011 grant application.

Bulman indicated that moving the National Register nomination project to the new grant application would provide the Commission with sufficient time to identify an appropriate property, secure the property owner's approval and present the request to the City Council for consideration.

Krull moved, Pier seconded and carried unanimously to authorize staff to proceed with the reallocation of the National Register grant funding to the Workshop line item for the 2009-2010 Certified Local Government Grant and to request funding for a National Register nomination project in the 2010-2011 grant application.

Dakota Middle School National Register Nomination

Elkins presented the Dakota Middle School official notification from the State Historic Preservation Office. Elkins reviewed the Report for Properties Nominated to the National Register noting that the Commission and the Chief Elected Official must complete and submit the report to the State Historic Preservation Office. Elkins suggested that the Commission schedule time during March to allow the property owner and the general public to comment on the nomination.

In response to a question from Roseland, Elkins indicated that she has not received any information on the Dakota Middle School Architecture Committee liaison appointments.

B. Kessloff addressed the numerous letters received in support of the nomination. Elkins indicated that the Commission is required to complete their portion of the Nomination Report, forward the report to the Mayor for completion of his portion and then submit the completed report to the State. Elkins indicated that if the Commission feels there has been adequate public input they can complete their portion of the report and forward it to the Mayor.

In response to a question from B. Kessloff, Bulman addressed the discussions at the State level that resulted in the Nomination Report process noting that the report is a State issue not a local issue. Bulman encouraged the Commission to discuss the nomination with the School Board.

Roseland recommended that the Commission meet with the School Board. Pier supported the recommendation to meet with the School Board and recommended that it be a facilitated meeting to allow for a structured constructive meeting for both parties. In response to a question, Elkins clarified that the State approval places the structure on the State Register noting that the nomination is then forwarded to the National level for action to include on the National Register.

Roseland recommended that the meeting be scheduled within the next few weeks. Baumgartner indicated that architectural plans are scheduled to be presented in March. Wagner requested that the Nomination Report be placed on the March 5, 2010 agenda for further discussion. Pier recommended researching the nomination process of other states.

In response to a question from B. Kessloff, Roseland indicated that members J. Kessloff and Baumgartner were put forward for liaison appointment to the Dakota Middle School Architecture Committee noting that as of yet the appointments have not been formalized.

Other Business

In response to a question from J. Kessloff, Elkins suggested that the cataloging of Oral Histories be addressed in the identification of the Commission's priorities at the March 3, 2010 training session.

Adjourn

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 9:04 a.m.