

Minutes of the May 3, 2013
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Members Present: Jean Kessloff, Sally Shelton, Duane Baumgartner, Jim Jackson, Shawn Krull, Bill Freytag, and Heather Knox

Members Absent: Gavin Williams and Lance Rom

Others Present: Katherine Palmer, Kip Harrington, Fred Thurston, Tim Goodwin, Stephanie King, and Mike Kissinger

Krull called the meeting to order at 7:30 a.m.

Approval of Meeting Agenda

Baumgartner requested to add a Letter of Thanks relating to the West Boulevard Historic District Street signs as an item under New Business.

Kessloff requested to add Historic Preservation Month Awards and Proclamation as an item under New Business.

Baumgartner moved to approve the agenda with the noted additions. The motion was seconded by Jackson and carried unanimously.

11.1 Reviews

727 South Street (13RS012)

Applicant: Fred Thurston

West Blvd Historic District – Contributing

Request: Remove and rebuild porch and steps. Phase 3 of McGillicuddy House Project.

Thurston reviewed the history of the renovation, and explained the next steps involving Phase 3 of the project. Phase 3 includes the reconstruction of the porch, porch roofing, and steps.

Freytag questioned the construction and repair of the foundation. Thurston stated the foundation is stone construction of two layers, and the outer layer was removed, a layer of plaster was added to the inner layer, and the outer layer was replaced.

Baumgartner questioned why the second story was removed in the past. Thurston suspected a fire, and Kessloff confirmed that there was a fire, but after the second story had been removed. Thurston believed the second story was removed due to rot and disrepair.

Baumgartner moved to recommend a finding that the removal and rebuilding of the porch and steps will have no adverse effect on the historic property at 727 South Street and was seconded by Jackson. The motion carried with Shelton, Baumgartner, Jackson, Krull, Freytag, and Knox voting yes and Kessloff abstaining.

923 Fulton Street (13RS013)

Applicant: Collins Siding

West Blvd Historic District – Contributing

Request: Retro-replacement of 6 double hung windows. Replace 3 storm glass with new insulated glass. Replace patio door with new patio door.

Tim Goodwin of Collins Siding described the house and the windows proposed to be changed, including the 6 retrofit windows and storm windows over the outside of the leaded glass windows. The house has already had some windows retrofitted.

In response to a question from Baumgartner, King explained the rear portion of the house is an addition from the 1970s. Goodwin explained that the patio door would be replaced with a traditional patio door, which would have the same look as the original.

Kessloff asked about the sash material. Goodwin stated that the frame would be a PVC frame to duplicate what has previously been done on the house.

Baumgartner moved to recommend a finding that the retro fitting of 6 double hung windows, the replacement of 3 storm windows, and the replacement of the patio door will have no adverse effect on the historic property at 923 Fulton Street. The motion was seconded by Knox.

In response to a question from Krull, King stated that all of the windows in the house are original, other than the kitchen window and the windows on the addition to the house.

Jackson asked about the condition of the windows. King stated the upstairs bedroom windows are deteriorated and water and insects are able to get in the house. Discussion followed.

Krull asked how the windows would be disposed of, and King stated they would be donated to the Historic Commission to add to their inventory. Discussion followed.

In response to a question from Kessloff, King reviewed the time frame of the previous window replacements.

Krull stated that the house is contributing, and is an excellent example of the style. Krull expressed concern of the cumulative effect of replacing windows, siding, and roofing materials. Discussion followed.

King discussed the construction of the windows and the historic character.

In response to a question from Jackson, Goodwin explained that the retrofit material would be vinyl. Jackson asked about the possibility of wood windows. Goodwin stated that they want to match the windows that had already been retrofitted.

In response to a question from Krull, King said three windows in the house had already been replaced. Thurston stated that since the house is contributing, it is not permissible by the standards to take out wood windows and replace them with vinyl. Wood windows should be repaired or replaced with wood to adhere to the standards, and would still solve all of the issues the homeowner spoke of.

Jackson concurred with Thurston's opinion. Discussion followed.

Freytag stated that retrofitting is allowed by the National Historic Trust. Kessloff responded that the National Historic Trust is a non-profit organization that supports the National Park Service. Discussion followed.

Krull expressed that vinyl, in general, does not meet the standards, spoke on cumulative effect on historic properties, and explained the property tax moratorium as an option.

Freytag asked the homeowner if she would be interested in replacing the three current vinyl windows with wood windows. King stated that the budget does not allow for the previously retrofitted windows to be changed to wood.

Freytag stated that similar projects had been allowed by the City Council.

Krull called the question. The motion to call the question was seconded by Jackson. The motion to call the question failed with Freytag voting yes and Shelton, Baumgartner, Jackson, Krull, Kessloff and Knox voting no.

Jackson moved no adverse effect if wood windows are used, and Shelton seconded.

Kissinger discussed vinyl versus wood windows in historic properties.

Thurston discussed the Buell Building and the vinyl window construction effects on the building.

King expressed concern about the effects of the house settling on wood windows.

Jackson stated that his role on the Historic Preservation Commission is to preserve historic properties, and that issues such as this are where he takes a stand.

Freytag stated that the homeowner is entitled to use modern materials in a retrofit, and discussed energy efficiency in historic properties.

Jackson moved to recommend a finding that if wood windows are used for the retro fitting of 6 double hung windows, the replacement of 3 storm windows, and the replacement of the patio door will have no adverse effect on the historic property at 923 Fulton Street. The motion was seconded by Shelton.

Jackson called the question. The motion carried with Shelton, Baumgartner, Jackson, Krull, Freytag and Knox voting yes and Kessloff voting no.

Approval of Minutes

Jackson moved to approve the April 19, 2013 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Baumgartner and carried unanimously.

New Business

Subcommittee on Streamlining Review Process

Update to documents

Palmer reviewed the document and the changes made since the last meeting. Discussion followed.

Jackson moved to accept the changes. The motion was seconded by Shelton.

In response from a question by Freytag, Knox expressed her opinion that the changes are acceptable from a legal perspective.

The motion carried with Shelton, Baumgartner, Jackson, Krull, Kessloff and Knox voting yes and Freytag voting no.

Palmer reviewed the postcard to be sent to property owners in the district.

Jackson moved to approve the postcard with corrections. The motion was seconded by Shelton. The motion carried unanimously.

Section 106 Review – Rapid City Airport

Palmer explained the process of Section 106 reviews and displayed the proposed changes to the airport. Discussion followed about the Section 106 process and the proposed project at the airport.

Section 106 Review – SD Programmatic Agreement

Palmer described the agreement and the provisions for the execution of the agreement. Discussion followed.

Letter of thanks for the West Boulevard Historic District street signs

Krull explained the project of replacing the street signs in the District. Discussion followed.

Baumgartner moved to draft letters to City Council and the Street Department thanking them for their efforts in the project. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

Historic Preservation Month Awards and Proclamation

Kessloff explained the proposed awards and proclamation. Discussion followed pertaining to the location of the exhibit and the schedule of events.

Knox moved to start the exhibition at the City/School Administration Center. The motion was seconded by Jackson and carried unanimously.

Kessloff moved to add items to the calendar without commission approval. The motion was seconded by Knox and carried unanimously.

Kesloff requested use of materials and photos for the Historic conference.

Jackson moved to allow the use of materials and photos. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

Jackson moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:52 a.m. The motion was seconded by Knox and carried unanimously.