

Minutes of the October 14, 2015
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Members Present: Eric Monroe, Ali DeMersseman, Clancy Kingsbury, John Riker, Nate Nelson and Alternates Chris Wehrle, Aaron Sanders and Tim Smith

Members Absent: Ken Orrock

Others Present: Sarah Hanzel, Patsy Horton, Jeanne Nicholson, Paul Bradsky, Brad Burns, Brad Hoag, and Ritchie Nordstrom, City Council Liaison

Monroe called the meeting to order at 7:45 a.m.

Approval of Meeting Agenda

Monroe requested to add Outreach Projects and the Certified Local Government Summit in Deadwood under Discussion Items. Hanzel stated that she would like to discuss the West Boulevard Association Meeting under Staff Items.

DeMersseman moved to approve the agenda with the noted additions. The motion was seconded by Riker and carried unanimously.

11.1 Reviews

523 6th Street (15CM009)

Applicant: Brad Burns for Cortez, LLC.

District: Downtown Commercial District - Contributing

Action Requested: Determine whether or not the Commission agrees with the findings of the case report and include any additional comments to the SHPO/City Council regarding the proposed project's adverse effect on historic property.

Hanzel briefly reviewed the request by addressing the proposed window types, current photographs, historic photographs and proposed window drawings.

Burns reminded the Commission that the Case Report is for the replacement of the windows on the third through the ninth floors. He added that sometime in the late 1970's and early 1980's, the windows were replaced with aluminum clad wood windows which are now old and inefficient. He explained that the guest rooms at the Hotel Alex Johnson will be upgraded and that the owners would like to do the window replacement at the same time. He added that the wood cottage double hung windows on the upper two floors will also be replaced and that these windows are also not original to the structure. Burns noted that the current window trim was placed over the old windows frames.

Hoag further explained that the old frames were covered up and noted that the new windows will be the same size and that there will be no changes to the exterior of the building. He added that the windows will be replaced from the inside.

Burns stated that the windows will have a fixed sash, won't open and will be triple pane glass for insulation and sound proofing purposes. He noted that the windows will have muntins between the glass panes. He further reviewed the proposed windows and noted that the windows will be the same

size as the current ones. He added that the existing original three windows on the alley side are not included in this request and noted that these windows have been covered up on the inside.

Bradsky stated that they would like to replace the three windows on alley side on the second floor using the same style of the proposed replacement windows, Type A.

Riker expressed his opinion that there will probably not be a lot of resistance to the proposed improvements.

Burns added that the divided lights will be installed on the north, east and south elevations but not on the west elevation.

Monroe reminded the Commission that the motion should be to agree, disagree or decline to comment on the case report.

Hanzel commented that the case report is to review the relevant information and prudent and feasible alternatives.

In response to a question from DeMersseman, Hanzel advised that the case report has been submitted to the State for their review but that they have requested the Commission's comments prior to the State making any comments on the case report.

Burns informed the Commission that tax credits are not being considered at this time.

In response to a question from Riker, Hoag reviewed the center mullion for window A which would be placed between two separate windows. He added that the thickness of the center mullion could be reviewed to determine if there are options for increasing the thickness to better match the original windows.

In response to a comment from Nelson regarding rust weeping and corrosion markings, Burns advised that the windows will be made of aluminum and that there will be no rust. He noted that the proposed windows are the same windows that were installed at Dakota Middle School.

Hoag briefly reviewed the installation process for the windows at Dakota Middle School and noted that the cost is reduced significantly if the windows can be installed from the interior.

In response to a question from Riker, Burns advised that the existing PTAC (packaged terminal air conditioner) units will be retained and noted that the color may have faded over time.

In response to a question from Riker, Hoag stated that the width of the muntins was reviewed and it was determined that the proposed width was the best option.

Riker stated that he would like the motion to include that the applicants determine if it is feasible to increase the width of the center mullion in order to more closely match the historic dimensions of the original windows.

DeMersseman moved to agree with the case report with the condition that a determination be made if it is feasible to increase the width of the mullion to match more closely with the historic profile of the original windows. The motion was seconded by Wehrle.

In response to a question from Kingsbury, Burns advised that the arches will be retained and that the lower windows will be replaced with double hung windows.

Bradsky informed the Commission that old photographs show the original windows being white and the next available drawings show the windows being bronze. He added that we want to retain the bronze look. He added that the PTAC units hold the air conditioners in place.

Monroe expressed his appreciation for the owners being sensitive to the historic appearance of this iconic building.

In response to a question from DeMersseman and a comment from Riker, Hanzel advised that the case report does not need to come back to the Commission for further review of a thicker mullion.

Burns commented that the motion should not specify the width of the mullion but that consideration be given to the possibility of increasing the width if it is feasibly possible. He added that the width of the mullion in the windows on the alley side should give us a good idea how wide they were on the other windows.

Burns inquired as to whether the case report can be amended to include the addition of the three windows on the alley side.

In response to a question from Riker regarding the vent in one of the alley windows, Bradsky advised that the kitchen will be remodeled and that he was not sure if the vent is even used. He noted that the alley windows are blacked out.

Riker moved to add the replacement of the three windows on the alley side with window A to the case report and that the Commission agrees with the proposed replacement of these three windows to window Type A. The motion was seconded by DeMersseman.

The motion to agree with the case report with the condition that a determination be made if it is feasible to increase the width of the mullion for window A to match more closely with the historic profile of the original windows carried unanimously.

The motion to add the replacement of the three windows on the alley side with window A to the case report and that the Commission agrees with the proposed replacement of these three windows carried unanimously.

Horton requested that a revised drawing for a wider mullion for window A be provided to the Commission for informational purposes.

Bradsky informed the Commission that the window replacement will be done in stages so the project does not impact tourist season and so that the window replacement will tie in with the remodeling.

Approval of Minutes

Kingsbury moved to approve the October 2, 2015 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Riker and carried unanimously.

Discussion Items

Certified Local Government Summit in Deadwood

Hanzel inquired as to whether any of the Commission members are interested in attending this conference. She briefly reviewed the conference itinerary. Hanzel requested the members to contact her no later than the end of Monday if they are interested in attending. She noted that travel arrangements will be determined at that time.

Outreach Projects

Monroe explained that the Commission is responsible to do one outreach project a year and suggested that the Commission come up with some ideas. He noted that one project could be reaching out to the public during Historic Preservation Month which is May. He added that maybe the Commission in conjunction with other groups could do something at Main Street Square.

Sanders suggested something more educational to inform the public about historic preservation.

Monroe suggested creating subcommittees.

A brief discussion followed regarding available financing for the outreach projects and other grant fund sources that are available.

Nordstrom expressed his opinion that maybe the Commission could have a booth at the West Boulevard Festival in Wilson Park. He also commented that the Journey Museum would be a good location to host an event.

Hanzel commented that staff and previous Commissions have checked into the West Boulevard Festival and that we were informed that we need to have some sort of craft item in the booth. She added that she will follow up with them again.

Discussion followed regarding the draft Design Guidelines. Monroe requested that this item be added to the next meeting agenda.

Riker moved that the Historic Preservation Commission not have a booth at the 2016 Black Hills Homebuilders Home Show. The motion was seconded by Nelson and carried unanimously.

Staff Items

Hanzel informed the Commission that we have been asked to present a program at the West Boulevard Neighborhood Association meeting on October 26, 2015 at 7:00 p.m. at the Nursing School. She encouraged the members to attend.

Hanzel thanked the Commission for their review and discussion of the case report for 523 6th Street. A brief discussion followed.

Hanzel encouraged the Commission members to be involved in the working groups for the Downtown Plan.

Kingsbury moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:56 a.m. The motion was seconded by DeMersseman and carried unanimously.