

Hanzel Sarah

From: Nelson, Kate <Kate.Nelson@state.sd.us>
Sent: Friday, August 07, 2015 2:52 PM
To: Hanzel Sarah
Cc: Spencer, Ted
Subject: RE: Case Report for 703 11th Street

Sarah,

Thank you for providing this additional information. On July 14, 2015, we issued our final comments to the city via letter stating that “the alterations to this building will damage a historic property which is included in the National and State Registers of Historic Places; however, based upon the information submitted, it appears that the owner has investigated feasible and prudent alternatives to the proposed projects.”

Based on these final comments, it is the responsibility of your office to determine whether there are any feasible and prudent alternatives to the project and whether the project includes all possible planning to minimize harm to the historic property, taking our comments into consideration. If the city determines that there are no feasible and prudent alternatives and that the project includes all possible planning to minimize harm, then the city must notify our office of the determination and include a record of factors considered. Ten days after our office receives the notification of the intent to issue the permit, the city may issue the permit.

Finally, we understand that the Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission reviewed this project at this morning’s meeting and made several comments and recommendations in order to minimize the effect of the project on the house (as noted below). The comments note that the existing wood siding is not cedar, as originally reported, but pine; the HPC suggested that replacing the pine siding with new pine siding would not be a prudent alternative because pine is not as resistant to rot or decay as is cedar. Additionally, the recommendations made by the HPC as outlined below appear to follow the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and we would suggest that following these recommendations would minimize the impact of the project on the historic property.

Thank you for contacting our office regarding this project. Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns. Thank you!

Kate Nelson, Restoration Specialist
South Dakota State Historical Society
State Historic Preservation Office
900 Governors Drive
Pierre SD 57501-2217
(605) 773-6005
(605) 773-6041 (fax)
Kate.Nelson@state.sd.us

From: Hanzel Sarah [<mailto:Sarah.Hanzel@rcgov.org>]
Sent: Friday, August 07, 2015 10:58 AM
To: Nelson, Kate
Subject: Case Report for 703 11th Street

Kate,

The Historic Preservation Commission reviewed the case report and made a motion to disagree with the findings of the case report based on the attached information. Furthermore it was determined that there is an error in the case report pertaining to the existing siding. The case report states that the siding is cedar when in fact there was evidence presented at the meeting that the siding is pine. As such, it was determined that though feasible, replacing the existing siding in kind would not be prudent since pine is not as rot resistant as cedar.

Furthermore, and given the information about the siding being pine and not cedar, the Commission made a motion to recommend that the request to replace the existing siding with a composite siding be approved with the following stipulations

- That the existing siding be removed
- That the new composite siding has a smooth finish
- That the composite siding matches the reveal of the existing siding (5 – 6")
- That the aluminum corner pieces be replaced in kind
- That the windows be trimmed with the composite siding to match the profile of the existing trim and drip cap
- That the entry pieces be replaced in kind, or repaired with an epoxy product
- That the existing gable vents be maintained and reused.

Please provide the SHPO's comments as to how to comply with the 11.1 review process going forward with this application. Thank you for your comments!

Sarah Hanzel
Long Range Planner I
City of Rapid City
Community Planning & Development Services
Division of Long Range Planning
300 Sixth Street
Rapid City, SD 57701
605-394-4120
sarah.hanzel@rcgov.org

Hanzel Sarah

From: Nelson, Kate <Kate.Nelson@state.sd.us>
Sent: Tuesday, July 14, 2015 8:43 AM
To: Hanzel Sarah
Cc: Nelson, Chris (CHC)
Subject: 703 11th St
Attachments: 150608004S_Hanzel.pdf

Hi Sarah,

Attached is our final letter regarding the siding project at 703 11th Street. The hard copy is in the mail to you as well. Chris and I reviewed the information you submitted and determined that the project would damage a historic property, but that it appears that the owners did consider alternatives. The City will now be responsible to make the final decision on issuing the permits, taking our comments into consideration. Please let me know if you have any questions. Thank you,

Kate Nelson, Restoration Specialist
South Dakota State Historical Society
State Historic Preservation Office
900 Governors Drive
Pierre SD 57501-2217
(605) 773-6005
(605) 773-6041 (fax)
Kate.Nelson@state.sd.us



July 14, 2015

Sarah Hanzel
City of Rapid City
300 6th St
Rapid City SD 57701

RE: SDCL 1-19A-11.1 Consultation

Project: 150608004S – 703 11th Street, Rapid City – Install wood composite siding, repair pediment at entry, replace crown molding and window trim with new painted wood
Location: Pennington County
(CORC)

Dear Ms. Hanzel:

On July 6, 2015, the South Dakota Office of the State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) received the abbreviated case report regarding the proposed replacement siding, repair of the entry pediment, and replacement of the crown molding and window trim for the home at 703 11th Street in Rapid City. This property is a contributing resource in the West Boulevard Historic District, which is listed on the National and State Registers of Historic Places. State law (SDCL 1-19A-11.1) outlines a specific process that must be followed prior to any governmental action that may damage, destroy, or encroach upon any historic property that is included on the State Register of Historic Places.

Based on the information provided in the abbreviated case report, the SHPO has made the following determination. The alterations to this building will damage a historic property which is included in the National and State Registers of Historic Places; however, based upon the information submitted, it appears that the owner has investigated feasible and prudent alternatives to the proposed projects.

As you take these comments into consideration, please remember that the City of Rapid City will be responsible for determining the fate of this historic structure. The decision must be based on consideration of all feasible and prudent alternatives and whether the proposal includes all possible planning to minimize harm to the historic property. Please note that, pursuant to SDCL 1-19A-11.1, if the City proceeds with the issuance of the building permits, ten days' notice by certified mail is required with the City's final determination prior to issuance of any permits.

Should you require any additional information, please contact Kate Nelson at (605) 773-6005.
Your concern for the non-renewable cultural heritage of South Dakota is appreciated.

Sincerely,

Jay D. Vogt
State Historic Preservation Officer

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Kate Nelson".

Kate Nelson
Restoration Specialist