

Minutes of the November 21, 2014
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Members Present: Sally Shelton, Lance Rom, Shawn Krull, Jean Kessloff, Bill Freytag and Clancy Kingsbury

Members Absent: Eric Monroe and Alternates Jody Speck and Doug Jones

Others Present: Sarah Hanzel, Jeanne Nicholson, Patsy Horton, Bryan Sykora and Brad Estes, City Council Liaison

Krull called the meeting to order at 7:30 a.m.

Approval of the Meeting Agenda

Freytag moved to approve the agenda. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

Kingsbury entered the meeting at this time.

11.1 Reviews

1115 Saint Joseph Street (14RS021)

Hanzel reviewed the Commission's action from the October 3, 2014 meeting on the previous 11.1 Review. She noted that the current 11.1 Review is to replace two picture windows and two double hung windows with pine insert windows. She addressed the aerial map, photographs and window specifications.

Sykora advised that the four side windows will be Marvin windows and the two center windows and the upstairs windows will be Pella windows.

Krull inquired as to whether the openings will be changed. Sykora explained that the openings may be slightly changed because of the type of windows but the existing trim will be used and will not be changed.

Rom moved to recommend a finding that replacing two picture windows and two double hung windows with pine insert windows and preserving the exterior trim and simulating the divided light pattern of the original windows will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 1115 Saint Joseph Street. The motion was seconded by Freytag.

In response to a question from Kessloff, Sykora explained that the existing frames will stay but the sashes will be removed. He added that it may be necessary to add an additional small frame around the Pella windows.

In response to question from Kessloff, Hanzel advised that the divided lights will be simulated to match the original windows.

The motion to recommend a finding that replacing two picture windows and two double hung windows with pine insert windows and preserving the exterior trim and simulating the divided light pattern of the original windows will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 1115 Saint Joseph Street carried unanimously.

In response to a question from Sykora regarding the first 11.1 Review, Krull explained that the application did not provide the Commission with adequate information to determine if the window replacements would have an adverse effect on the property. A brief discussion followed.

Approval of Minutes

Shelton moved to approve the November 7, 2014 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Kingsbury and carried unanimously.

New Business

Commissioner Bio's – 1 to 2 sentences.

Krull informed the Commission that he has started receiving some feedback from the Commission members.

Subcommittees Updates

No subcommittee updates were reported.

SHPO Summary Report

SHPO concurred with the findings from the 11/7/2014 11.1 Reviews. In response to a question from a Commission member regarding the Commission's finding of No Adverse Effect for 1216 Quincy Street, Kate Nelson responded:

"We looked at the information presented in the application, which said that there were substantial changes to the home during a 1999 remodel, including all new windows and doors; moved or enlarged openings; removed interior hallways; added exterior exits; a large deck added to upper floor; all interiors remodeled and modernized; and significant structural work. All of that work, which apparently didn't trigger the 11.1 review process, already damaged the integrity of the home. With that as our starting point, we determined that the replacement of existing siding of various styles and sizes with new fiber cement siding would not have an adverse effect, given the home's compromised integrity to start with.

As you know, the Standards must be applied on a case-by-case basis since no two buildings or projects are the same. In this case, we determined that the previous changes had compromised the integrity of the building to the point that further changes to the siding would not adversely affect the house or the district as a whole."

Freytag asked if the property at 1216 Quincy Street has been reclassified to non-contributing.

Kessloff advised that reclassification of property occurs when a resurvey is done.

Freytag informed the Commission that he cannot attend work sessions scheduled at 8:00 a.m. He added that later afternoons work better for him.

In response to a question from Hanzel, Krull advised that he is working on the Commission's comments regarding the Lehe Final Report. He added that he hopes to have the comments to staff sometime next week.

Freytag moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:44 a.m. The motion was seconded by Rom and carried unanimously.