

Minutes of the November 7, 2014  
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

**Members Present:** Jean Kessloff, Sally Shelton, Shawn Krull, Bill Freytag, Clancy Kingsbury, Lance Rom and Alternates Doug Jones and Jody Speck

**Members Absent:** Eric Monroe

**Others Present:** Sarah Hanzel, Jeanne Nicholson, Patsy Horton, Justin Lena, Curt Smith, Lee Geiger, Mario Rangel and Brad Estes, City Council Liaison

Krull called the meeting to order at 7:30 a.m.

**Approval of the Meeting Agenda**

**Kingsbury moved to approve the agenda. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.**

**11.1 Reviews**

**1216 Quincy Street (14RS024)**

Hanzel reviewed the request and noted that the new siding will be 5" HardiPlank siding instead of 4" siding. She addressed the application, aerial map and photographs.

**Freytag moved to recommend a finding that replacing the original cedar siding with 5" HardiPlank siding to match the existing profile will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 1216 Quincy Street. The motion was seconded by Kingsbury.**

Kessloff commented that it is unfortunate that the windows, siding and doors have been replaced on this structure. She added that the fish scale trim is a decorative element that has been added and is not a historic feature of the house.

**The motion to recommend a finding that replacing the original cedar siding with 5" HardiPlank siding to match the existing profile will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 1216 Quincy Street carried with Freytag, Shelton, Krull, Kingsbury and Jones voting yes and Kessloff and Rom voting no.**

**914 Columbus Street (14RS025)**

Hanzel reviewed the request and addressed the application, aerial map and photographs.

Smith informed the Commission that the concrete was poured when the three car garage was built and that the fourth garage was not built due to an easement issue which has been resolved. He added that the new garage will match the existing structure.

In response to a question from Krull, Smith advised that the three car garage was built approximately 20 years ago and he is unsure if the Commission existed at that time.

In response to a question from Jones, Smith advised that the existing and new garage stalls are used for residents of the apartments.

**Kingsbury moved to recommend a finding that the addition of a 12' x 24' garage to the existing garage with matching 12" Masonite siding and asphalt shingles will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 914 Columbus Street. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.**

922 5th Street (14CM017)

Hanzel reviewed the request and addressed the revised application and site drawings, and the photographs.

In response to a question from Krull, Geiger explained that Pella fiberglass windows will still be used and that the window in the bathroom on the north side is not shown on the site plan submitted with the revised application.

Jody Speck and Mario Rangel entered the meeting at this time.

Kingsbury inquired as to whether the appearance of the window setbacks will change.

Geiger noted that the owners' desire is to have the windows installed flush with where the current aluminum storm windows are located. He added that the windows would be a little closer to the exterior surface.

Jones expressed his opinion that there would not be a visual change to the windows if they were set out a little closer to the exterior surface.

In response to a question from Kessloff, Geiger responded that we are unsure if the existing windows are the original windows. He added that the windows are not falling apart but there is rot in the windows and the sashes.

In response to a question from Kessloff about restoring the windows, Geiger explained that the windows on the south side are below grade and need to be replaced with a product that is rot resistant. He added that the window sills at-grade are deteriorating. He advised that the applicant would like to replace the windows now before work starts on refinishing the basement.

In response to a question from Kessloff, Jones briefly reviewed the installation of the windows and noted that the condition of the buck will be determined at the time the old windows are removed. He added that there also may need to be some cleanup work done on the stone.

Geiger commented that the condition of the buck and stone will be determined as the project progresses.

Freytag asked the contractor if they anticipate any damage occurring to the masonry as the windows are being replaced.

Rangel advised that they don't anticipate a lot of damage to the masonry and the bucks. He added that two of the windows on the south side are currently located underneath the handicap ramp. He noted that the window covers on the south side have also helped in preserving the windows but they are deteriorating and need to be replaced.

Brad Estes entered the meeting at this time.

In response to a question from Kingsbury regarding the appearance of the windows above grade, Rangel explained that expanders, if necessary, will be installed around the outside of the new window

frames and will be custom made to tie into the windows and the masonry. He added that the expanders and the caulk will be the same color as the windows.

Kingsbury expressed his opinion that the windows should be setback from the masonry.

Geiger commented that the new windows will not extend past where the existing aluminum storm windows are located.

In response to a question from Kessloff about divided lights, Rangel explained that the grids will be located between the panes of glass and that the width of the grids will be no larger than 3/4".

Kessloff expressed concern with the profile being changed and the grids being placed between the panes of the glass.

In response to a question from Freytag, Rangel advised that the storm windows will not be used once the new windows are installed.

**Freytag moved to recommend a finding that replacing 13 basement windows with fiberglass windows to closely match the existing profile and finish will have no adverse effect on the property located at 922 5th Street. The motion was seconded by Kingsbury and carried with Freytag, Rom, Shelton, Krull, Kingsbury and Jones voting yes and Kessloff voting no.**

#### **Approval of Minutes**

**Shelton moved to approve the October 17, 2014 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Freytag and carried unanimously.**

#### **Treasurer's Report**

##### **Budget Information – September 30, 2014**

Hanzel informed the Commission that the budget reflects the current charges for September. A brief discussion followed.

#### **Staff Items**

##### **2015 Home Show**

Hanzel reviewed the deadline for submitting the Commission's registration for the Home Show. She added that the event was not included in the Public Outreach Program but funding would be available if the Commission decides to participate in the event.

Kessloff expressed her opinion that the Home Show is a great event for the Historic Preservation Commission to promote historic preservation. She added that the Commission needs to be committed to working the event.

Freytag expressed his opinion that he did not see much value in the Historic Preservation Commission participating in the Home Show. He added that he would not participate.

Krull commented that it is nice for the Historic Preservation Commission to be visible to the public at this event but he understands that the members have other commitments and are unable to assist in preparing and/or being able to work in the booth. He added that the funds for this event could be spent on other public outreach projects.

Freytag and Rom concurred that a single booth would be adequate instead of having a double booth as they have had in the past.

Jones commented that it is important that all people working in the booth give out a uniform message about historic preservation.

Kingsbury expressed his opinion that one booth would be adequate and that a large map identifying the boundaries of the Historic District be included in the booth. He added that tax credit and grant information also need to be available. Additional discussion followed.

**Freytag moved that the Historic Preservation Commission not participate in the 2015 Home Show and that the funds designated for this event be used for other public education projects. The motion died due to a lack of a second.**

**Rom moved that the Historic Preservation Commission reserve a single booth for the 2015 Home Show. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.**

#### SHPO letter to the City in response to the Lehe Report and Recommendations

Hanzel informed the Commission that SHPO's letter is posted on the City's HPC website. She added that any other comments received will be added to the public comments on the website.

Hanzel reminded the Commission about the special meeting that is scheduled for November 12, 2014 at 8:00 a.m.

#### Summitt

Hanzel briefly reviewed the Summit Conference and advised that there was representation from many communities throughout the state.

#### SHPO letter to the City in response to the Lehe Report and Recommendations

A brief discussion followed regarding the Memorandum of Agreement.

#### **Subcommittees Updates**

##### Website

Krull advised the website is close to going live.

In response to a question from Jones regarding 1216 Quincy Street, Hanzel advised that Building Inspection was notified about the project. A brief discussion followed regarding the building permit process.

#### **City Council Action Report**

##### 1725 9th Street

Krull advised that the property is for sale.

Freytag commented that this was a good instance that the City Council did not approve the appeal and that they supported the Commission's recommendation.

**Shelton moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:39 a.m. The motion was seconded by Freytag and carried unanimously.**