

Minutes of the December 6, 2013
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Members Present: Jean Kessloff, Sally Shelton, Lance Rom, Jim Jackson, Bill Freytag and Shawn Krull

Members Absent: None

Others Present: Kip Harrington, Jeanne Nicholson, Bob Cathey, Karen Cathey, Kevin Cathey, Jon Jensen, Debra Jensen, Bob Fuchs, Gene Wittkowske, Tim Goodwin and Brad Estes, City Council Liaison

Krull called the meeting to order at 7:30 a.m.

Approval of the Meeting Agenda

Harrington requested to add the renewal for the National Trust for Historic Preservation under Budget Information and a memo from the State Historic Preservation Office regarding a conference for certified local governments under New Business.

Jackson moved to approve the agenda with the noted additions. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

11.1 Reviews

1116 South Street (13RS031)

Bob Cathey informed the Commission that the owner is an elderly gentleman who wants to use a metal roof to reduce the maintenance on the structure. He added that the current asphalt shingles are in very poor shape. Bob Cathey noted that the metal roof would be an earth tone color and that pictures of other structures in the neighborhood with metal roofs have been provided to the Commission for your review.

Jackson moved to recommend a finding that the replacement of the asphalt shingles with metal roofing will have an adverse effect on the historic property located at 1116 South Street. The motion was seconded by Rom.

Kessloff stated that she reviewed this property on the Sanborn Maps and that they indicate the roof was a wood shingle roof. She expressed her opinion that asphalt shingles would be appropriate for this property.

Rom and Freytag concurred that asphalt shingles would be appropriate for this property.

Kessloff reminded the Commission that there are very few houses in the neighborhood that have metal roofs and that they are not common in this area. Additional discussion followed.

Bob Cathey explained that one of the roofs in the area is metal that has the appearance of a tiled roof. He added that there currently are commercial properties in the neighborhood that have metal roofs.

The motion to recommend a finding that the replacement of the asphalt shingles with metal roofing will have an adverse effect on the historic property located at 1116 South Street carried with Jackson, Kessloff, Krull, Rom and Shelton voting yes and Freytag voting no.

Freytag moved to authorize the property owner to replace the existing asphalt shingles with new asphalt shingles. The motion was seconded by Jackson and carried unanimously.

617 - 619 West Boulevard (13RS032)

Goodwin explained that the house currently has metal siding but the garage does not. He added that the brick was replaced with the rock front. He noted that the homeowner is planning to make improvements that have historic characteristics to better blend in with the neighborhood. Goodwin inquired as to whether the house is still a contributing structure because of the alterations that have been made to it.

In response to a question from Rom, Wittkowske explained that the garage currently has ship lap siding on it and that at one time the house had clapboard and sheet plank siding on it.

Freytag moved to recommend a finding that replacing the metal lap siding with 7 inch fiber cement or LP Smartside siding, wrapping windows with metal and replacing the soffit and fascia with metal will have no adverse effect on the property located at 617 – 619 West Boulevard. The motion was seconded by Jackson.

Kessloff explained that the National Register nomination and inventory says the structure is contributing which means that the previous changes did not have an adverse effect on the structure. A brief discussion followed concerning the current siding on the structure.

In response to a question from Kessloff, Wittkowske stated that the current siding has hail damage and is chalking.

Goodwin noted that the metal siding on the house was placed over the previous siding.

Krull expressed his opinion that a wood texture siding would be inappropriate for the structure and recommended that a smooth surface siding be used.

Wittkowske explained that a smooth texture siding is available but they are not as popular and that the textured finished siding has better warranties. A brief discussion followed.

Kessloff informed the Commission that the proposed siding is not approved by the Secretary of Interior standards. She added that the property owner would be eligible for tax credits to repair the structure because it is a rental property. She asked if the soffits, fascia and window wraps will be dealt with separately.

Kessloff moved to recommend that the Commission separate the siding from the soffits, fascia and window wrap. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

Jackson expressed his opinion that the Commission should make a recommendation to the State to see what they approve.

Jackson called the question.

The motion to recommend a finding that replacing the metal lap siding with 7 inch fiber cement or LP Smartside siding, wrapping windows with metal and replacing the soffit and fascia with metal will have no adverse effect on the property located at 617 – 619 West Boulevard failed with Kessloff, Krull, Shelton and Rom voting no and Freytag and Jackson voting yes.

In response to a question from Kessloff, Goodwin advised that metal wrap will be used for the windows because of low maintenance and that the wraps will protect the existing wood frames and brick moulds. He added that there will be no soffit behind the gutters but there will be a fascia board.

Wittkowske added that aluminum combination windows have been inserted into the window frames.

Rom expressed his opinion that the contributing structure has already been altered and that he does not want to add to many more alterations to the structure so that the contributing status is jeopardized.

Goodwin added that the windows are weather checked and not rotten but the windows need to be wrapped to protect the wood because paint will not adhere to the wood frames. A brief discussion followed.

Jackson moved to recommend a finding that wrapping the window brick moulds with metal and replacing the soffit and fascia with metal will have an adverse effect on the property located at 617 – 619 West Boulevard. The motion was seconded by Rom and carried with Jackson, Kessloff, Krull, Rom and Shelton voting yes and Freytag voting no.

909 Mount Rushmore Road (13CM018)

Jensen explained that they would like to remove the building to allow for additional parking for Black Hills Bagels. He added that a temporary surface will be placed in the area of the structure and that the entire parking lot will be repaved once the construction of Mount Rushmore Road has been completed.

Jackson moved to recommend a finding that the demolition and removal of the building will have no adverse effect on the property located at 909 Mount Rushmore Road. The motion was seconded by Shelton.

A brief discussion followed regarding the age of the building and salvaging building materials.

The motion to recommend a finding that the demolition and removal of the building will have no adverse effect on the property located at 909 Mount Rushmore Road carried with Freytag, Jackson, Krull, Rom and Shelton voting yes and Kessloff abstaining.

616 - 620 Main Street (13CM019)

Fuchs explained the request and noted that a winery and a tasting room will be located in this portion of the building. He added that the exterior of the building will not be changed, that the oak flooring on the west side of the building will be retained, that the flooring on the east side will be replaced, that the temporary walls will be removed, that the tin ceiling will be restored, that the old openings will be reopened and the rock will not be disturbed.

Rom moved to recommend a finding that the interior tenant finish will have no adverse effect on the property located at 616 – 620 Main Street. The motion was seconded by Shelton.

In response to a question from Kessloff, Fuchs explained that the tin ceiling on the east side has been painted but will be restored, that the tin ceiling on the west side is original and that a tin ceiling will be installed in the middle.

The motion to recommend a finding that the interior tenant finish will have no adverse effect on the property located at 616 – 620 Main Street carried unanimously.

1105 Saint Cloud Street (13RS030)

Harrington briefly reviewed the request to redesign the front pergola.

Freytag expressed his opinion that the Commission should not take action on this 11.1 Review because the applicant is not present. Rom concurred.

Shelton moved to continue to the 11.1 Review for 1105 Saint Cloud Street to the next meeting. The motion was seconded by Jackson and carried unanimously.

Approval of the Minutes

Jackson moved to approve the November 15, 2013 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

Treasurer's Report

1. Budget Information
 - a. Renewal for the National Trust for Historic Preservation

Shelton moved to pay \$50, same as last year, for the Renewal for the National Trust for Historic Preservation. The motion was seconded by Jackson and carried unanimously.

New Business

Design Guidelines Update

Harrington informed the Commission that a digital version of the Design Guidelines is available and suggested that a subcommittee be formed to review the Design Guidelines.

Kessloff stated that a subcommittee already exists which consists of Kessloff and Rom. She added that Michelle Dennis was previously on the subcommittee.

Memorandum of Joint Powers Agreement Extension #2

Harrington explained that the extension has been approved by the City Council. He added the extension was on the previous meeting agenda but the Commission did not take action on the item.

Rom expressed his opinion that the agreement should be reviewed for updates.

Rom moved to create a subcommittee to review the agreement for any necessary updates. The motion was seconded by Jackson and carried unanimously.

Krull and Rom volunteered to serve on the subcommittee.

Subcommittees

- | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------|
| 1. West Boulevard Photo Project | J Kessloff |
| 2. Streamlining Subcommittee | Palmer |
| 3. Property Nomination Subcommittee | Krull |

Krull expressed his opinion that the Streamlining Subcommittee should be removed from list.

Concurrence with SDDOT report on Mount Rushmore Road Construction

Rom inquired as to the status of the letter from the Commission that staff was requested to provide for the Chairman's signature.

Harrington informed the Commission that the letter was drafted as directed by the Commission and is being reviewed by staff. A brief discussion followed.

Other Business

1. Buildings for Recognition

Kessloff reminded the Commission that Historic Preservation Week is in May and that the Commission should start considering ideas for this event.

2. Buildings in Peril
 - a. Buell Building
 - b. Aby's Feed & Seed Elevator - Baumgartner
 - c. 1000 Block of Saint Joseph Street
 - d. 808 Saint Joseph Street (Old Business College)
 - e. 812 Saint Joseph Street (Old Lakota Lodge)
 - f. 615 Kansas City Street (Kegaries-Dawley Clinic) - Kessloff
 - g. Soo San Hospital Complex

Kessloff reminded the Commission that each member took a couple of addresses to review and follow up on the structures. She added that this is still appropriate to do.

Freytag advised that he would like to review the Soo San Hospital Complex. Kessloff also volunteered to review this property.

3. Structures in Peril
 - a. Rock guardrails on south end of Skyline Drive

Harrington advised that the reconstruction of Skyline Drive has been discussed by staff but is not planned at this time. A brief discussion followed.

4. Public Education
 - a. Salvaging of Historical Materials

Freytag expressed his opinion that a letter should be made available to the public stating that Jean Kessloff has an inventory of historical materials for distribution. Kessloff suggested that the public be directed to contact the Commission for the salvage materials.

5. Monthly update of Historic Rapid City
Kessloff provided a brief update on the McGillicuddy House.

Website

Krull informed the Commission that he will be meeting with Sharp and Associates on Wednesday at 10:00 a.m. about the website and recommended a subcommittee be created to work on the website.

Letter on the proposed cell phone tower on Tomahawk Drive

Krull informed the Commission that he received a letter about the proposed cell phone tower on Tomahawk Drive. A brief discussion followed about the impact it will have on Rapid City. Krull and Rom will review and submit comments to Terracon.

Memo from State Historic Preservation Office regarding a conference for certified local governments

Harrington advised that the memo states that the State is considering holding a conference for representatives from certified local governments. A brief discussion followed.

Rom requested that the memo be emailed to the Commission members.

Krull requested that this item be on the next meeting agenda.

There being no further business, Shelton moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:42 a.m.