

Minutes of the August 16, 2013
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Members Present: Lance Rom, Jean Kessloff, Sally Shelton, Jim Jackson, Bill Freytag and Shawn Krull

Members Absent: None

Others Present: Kip Harrington, Patsy Horton, Jeanne Nicholson, Brett Limbaugh, Michelle Dennis, John Welker, Tim Goodwin, David Hubbard and Brad Estes, City Council Liaison

Krull called the meeting to order at 7:30 a.m.

Approval of the Meeting Agenda

Jackson informed the Commission that the proof for the sign to be used in the booth for the Black Hills Realtor Convention is available for Commission review and requested that an item be added to the agenda. Krull requested to add Robert Sharp and Associates under Budget Information. Kessloff requested to add Tax Moratorium as an item under New Business.

Jackson moved to approve the agenda with the noted additions. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

11.1 Reviews

804, 806, & 808 St. Joseph Street (13CM013)

Horton briefly explained that the National Register identifies the address for the property in question as 802 St. Joseph Street. She further explained the addresses for the tenants in the structure and noted that the Business College is being renovated and the Lakota Lodge is not.

Welker reviewed the proposed request and noted that one tenant operates the two stores on the main level. He explained that all non-original walls will be removed and the main level will be divided into two spaces, preserving the existing beams and hardwood floors. He added that the existing restrooms will remain in their current locations and will be renovated and that an office will be provided for each space. Welker also reviewed the site plan, the removal of the ceiling, the fire sprinkler system, lighting and the HVAC system. He added that they will salvage as many historic features as possible.

Kessloff moved to discuss the 11.1 Review. The motion was seconded by Rom.

In response to a question from Kessloff, Welker advised that they do not have any information on the original building. He added that they have determined that three different ceilings have been installed in the main level of the structure.

Kessloff expressed her opinion that the building was not originally built for industrial purposes and that the Secretary of Interior Standards would support the ceiling joints not being exposed.

Welker stated that they would prefer to expose the beams because they would be more appealing for the businesses.

In response to a comment from Krull regarding the noise level between the apartments and the main level, Welker explained that there is a crawl space between the two levels and added that the ceiling on the main floor is not original but the beam system is. A lengthy discussion followed.

In response to a comment from Freytag, Dennis advised that the beams are original and that there is no evidence or pictures showing if they were exposed or not.

Freytag made a substitute motion to recommend a finding that the remodeling of the main floor and the addition of the fire sprinklers will have no adverse effect on the property located at 804, 806, & 808 St. Joseph Street. The motion died due to a lack of a second.

In response to question from Krull, Welker advised that the store front windows will remain as is and that the awnings will be removed and historic lighting will be added to the exterior of the building.

Jackson moved to recommend a finding that the remodeling of the main floor and the addition of the fire sprinklers will have no adverse effect on the property located at 804, 806, & 808 St. Joseph Street with the stipulation that the original ceiling above the false ceiling remain intact.

In response to a question from Freytag, Welker explained that the original ceiling lath and plaster has been removed. Additional discussion followed.

The motion died due to a lack of a second.

Krull expressed his opinion that the Commission does not have enough information to make a decision on the 11.1 Review and suggested that the applicant provide a video showing the existing ceilings in the structure.

Welker explained that the entire ceiling will either have to be new drywall or exposed beams. He added that if the Commission and the State approve a drywall ceiling, the applicant will probably appeal to the City Council for the exposed beams.

Additional discussion followed regarding the appropriate ceiling for the structure.

Jackson withdrew his motion to recommend a finding that the remodeling of the main floor and the addition of the fire sprinklers will have no adverse effect on the property located at 804, 806, & 808 St. Joseph Street with the stipulation that the original ceiling above the false ceiling remain intact.

Freytag moved to recommend a finding that the renovation of the main floor which will include two HVAC units, the renovation of the restrooms, the removal of the ceiling to expose the original beams and maintaining the original wood flooring and the installation of fire sprinklers throughout the Rapid City Business College structure will have no adverse effect on the property located at 804, 806, & 808 St. Joseph Street. The motion was seconded by Jackson and carried with Freytag, Jackson, Rom, Shelton and Krull voting yes and Kessloff voting no.

610 11th Street (13RS021)

Goodwin reviewed the proposed request and explained that seven windows will be double hung and the picture window will be a fixed window. He added that the windows are Pella Encompass Pure Vinyl PVC windows and that the windows were custom made to be retrofitted into the existing cavities.

Freytag moved to recommend a finding that the replacement and retrofitting of the eight existing windows with Pella Encompass windows would have no adverse effect on the property located at 610 11th Street. The motion was seconded by Rom.

In response to a question from Kessloff, Goodwin advised that he was unsure when the hardy board siding was installed and noted that it is not the original siding.

Jackson expressed his opinion that in order to preserve the historical characteristics of the home, the windows need to be made of wood, whether they are new or repaired. He added that he cannot support vinyl or PVC windows in historic properties.

A lengthy discussion followed regarding the installation of wood windows versus vinyl windows.

Dennis added that the State has indicated in the past that vinyl windows and vinyl siding can affect the contributing status of historic properties. Horton concurred.

Freytag expressed his opinion that the current siding and current windows may have affected the contributing status of the house and noted that the City Council has previously approved appeals for retrofitting windows.

Jackson stated that the Commission has a responsibility to preserve the historical integrity of the structures located in the historic district and that he cannot support vinyl windows or siding. He added that he could possibly support the replacement of the windows if it was an economical hardship for the homeowner.

Kessloff advised that she cannot support the vinyl windows and added that the siding was installed less than a year ago. She added that this is one of three alley houses in this alley remaining on the registry. She expressed her opinion that the applicant has not provided any prudent and feasibility alternatives for the window replacement.

Freytag amended the motion to recommend a finding that the replacement and retrofitting of the eight existing windows with Pella Encompass windows would have no adverse effect on the property located at 610 11th Street because the State may find that the installation of the new siding on the house may have changed the contributing status to non-contributing status prior to the installation of the new windows. The amended motion died due to a lack of a second.

The motion to recommend a finding that the replacement and retrofitting of the eight existing windows with Pella Encompass windows would have no adverse effect on the property located at 610 11th Street failed with Jackson, Kessloff, Krull, Rom and Shelton voting no and Freytag voting yes.

Jackson moved to recommend a finding that the replacement and retrofitting of the eight existing windows with Pella Encompass windows would have an adverse effect on the property located at 610 11th Street and that the supplemental information submitted by Jackson be included in the file to be provided to the City Council in the event there is an appeal for the 11.1 Review. The motion was seconded by Kessloff and carried with Jackson, Kessloff, Krull, Rom and Shelton voting yes and Freytag voting no.

Estes expressed his opinion that the City Council is not in a position to make a well informed decision on appeals if the prudent and feasible information is not provided. A brief discussion followed.

Jackson requested that Estes inform the City Council that the Historic Preservation Commission strongly supports preserving the historical integrity of the properties located in the Historic District.

Rom inquired as to whether the Commission could reconsider the motion to change the motion to no adverse effect if wood windows are used. Horton informed the Commission that they would need to make a motion to reconsider the motion.

Rom asked if the City has any recourse if the proper permits were not obtained for the installation of the new siding.

Horton advised that when Building Inspection receives a complaint, Building Inspection will follow up on it.

Freytag pointed out that the application does identify information about the comparisons between wood windows versus vinyl windows as they relate to costs, UBC code and the warranty.

Kessloff stated that the prudent and feasible information should be actual costs with supporting documentation. Additional discussion followed.

Freytag asked if the applicant would be willing to replace the windows with wood windows. Goodwin advised that he would visit with the applicants about using wood windows instead of the vinyl windows.

Horton suggested that the applicant could consider replacing the outside windows with wood storm windows and wood screen windows as a window replacement option provided by Bob Yapp, a nationally known preservationist.

Jackson moved to reconsider motion. The motion was seconded by Freytag and carried unanimously.

Rom moved to recommend a finding that the replacement of the eight existing windows with wood windows would have no adverse effect on the property located at 610 11th Street. The motion was seconded by Freytag.

Kessloff suggested that the applicant consider repairing the windows instead of replacing the windows.

The motion to recommend a finding that the replacement of the eight existing windows with wood windows would have no adverse effect on the property located at 610 11th Street carried unanimously.

Goodwin commented Collins Siding tries to follow the City requirements and that they have concern with people that don't follow the rules.

Jackson suggested that if Collins Siding is aware of someone that is not following the City requirements, they should contact Building Inspection about the possible violation.

Freytag departed the meeting at this time.

Approval of Minutes

Shelton moved to approve the July 24, 2013 and the August 2, 2013 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Jackson and carried unanimously.

Treasurer's Report

Budget Information

Krull provided a proposal from Robert Sharp and Associates for the website design and information management for Historic Preservation to the Commission. He added that Robert Sharpe and Associates would be willing to work with the Commission on the development of the website. A brief discussion followed.

Jackson moved to accept the proposal from Robert Sharp and Associates for the website design and development for Historic Preservation. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

Krull informed the Commission that the budget identifies \$4,500 for the development of the website and requested a motion to increase the budget item to \$4,998 to cover the costs for the proposal submitted by Robert Sharp and Associates.

Jackson moved to increase the budget for the website design from \$4,500 to \$4,998 to cover the costs for the proposal from Robert Sharp and Associates. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

Krull asked for volunteers to work on the subcommittee to review the development of the website. A brief discussion followed.

Dennis reminded the Commission that when reviewing window themes, the Commission needs to look at the National Park Service requirements and the Secretary of Interior Standards for guidance.

Shelton moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:02 a.m. The motion was seconded by Jackson and carried unanimously.