

Minutes of the January 18, 2013
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Members Present: Jean Kessloff, Bill Freytag, Michelle Dennis, Duane Baumgartner, Sally Shelton, Lance Rom, Gavin Williams and Heather Knox

Members Absent: Pat Roseland and Eric James

Others Present: Katherine Palmer, Kip Harrington, Jeanne Nicholson, Alex DeSmidt, Deborah Gangloff, Bill Kessloff, Patri Acevedo, Mike Stanley, Gene Wittkowske, Bill Honeycutt, Chris Wells and Bonny Petersen – City Council Liaison

Baumgartner called the meeting to order at 7:31 a.m.

Approval of Meeting Agenda

Palmer requested that the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions membership renewal be added as an item under New Business.

Williams moved to approve the agenda with the noted addition. The motion was seconded by Knox and carried unanimously.

11.1 Reviews

903 11th Street (13RS002)

Palmer advised that Blaise Emerson could not attend today's meeting and has requested that the 11.1 Review be continued to the February 1, 2013 meeting.

Dennis moved to continue the 11.1 Review for 903 11th Street to the February 1, 2013 meeting. The motion was seconded by Kessloff and carried unanimously.

1711 9th Street (13RS003)

Wittkowske informed the Commission that the four inch reveal siding will be replaced with composite wood siding with a seven inch reveal, the deteriorated trim will be replaced and that there will be no alterations to the windows. Honeycutt added that the new siding will be the same as the siding on the house next door and that there will be no change to the aesthetics of the neighborhood.

Kessloff moved to recommend a finding that the replacement of the existing siding with LP smart side clapboard will have an adverse effect on historic property. The motion was seconded by Williams.

In response to a question from Williams, Palmer responded that the property is non-contributing. Kessloff pointed out that the Historic Inventory indicates that the property is National Register eligible and it appears there is a discrepancy in the contributing or non-contributing designation for the property.

Goble inquired as to why there is an issue with the non-contributing designation. Baumgartner explained that when the Historic District was formed, the house was contributing and due to time and changes to the structure, the designation has changed to non-contributing.

Palmer added that the requirement for permits to be obtained for siding projects in the Historic District is a result of changes made to the ordinance this past June; no matter if it is a contributing or non-contributing home.

In response to a question from Freytag, Honeycutt advised that the reveal will be seven inches.

Williams explained that the house next door with the masonite siding with an eleven inch reveal was done before the new ordinance was adopted.

Dennis suggested that the Commission postpone making a decision on the 11.1 Review until the contributing and non-contributing designation can be verified by the State.

Goble expressed concern with a delay because they are trying to live in the house with no siding.

Honeycutt explained the reasons why the stop order was issued and noted that we were totally unaware of the changes that were made to the ordinance. Additional discussion followed.

Freytag expressed his support for the 11.1 Review because of the improvements to the house and expressed concern with delaying the 11.1 Review for two weeks. Knox concurred.

Discussion followed regarding the processes for ordinance updates.

Freytag made a substitute motion to recommend a finding that the replacement of the existing siding with LP smart side clapboard will have no adverse effect on historic property. The motion was seconded by Knox and carried with Freytag, Shelton, Baumgartner and Knox voting yes, Kessloff voting no and Rom, Williams and Dennis abstaining.

515 West Blvd (13PB001)

DeSmidt informed the Commission that the Parks and Recreation Department has been requested to have a section of Halley Park be developed into a sculpture garden for First Nations. He added that he has researched the review processes and would like to request input from the Historic Preservation Commission.

Stanley added that the sculpture garden would be a memorial commemorating Native Americans and that it is not a war or warrior memorial. He reviewed the initial drawing outlining the location of the eight busts, eight nodes and a timeline in the center. He stated that the Rose Gardens and Korean War Memorial would remain untouched.

In response to a question from Freytag, Stanley explained that the gardens would be located approximately a couple of hundred feet behind the building and that an existing intermittent sidewalk would be removed.

In response to a question from Dennis, Stanley reviewed the dimensions of the garden and the materials for the nodes, sidewalks and busts. He added that the sculptures will be constructed to be in proportion with the building and that the small trees will be transplanted. He further explained that this location is part of the original treaty land that the Native Americans transferred to the City of Rapid in approximately 1952.

Gangloff further explained that this location is where lot of Native Americans lived prior to the building of Mt. Rushmore. She added that the sculptures will replace an attraction that was previously located at this location and that the garden will not be promoted as a destination attracting visitors. She added that the site would be used as a place for meditation.

In response to a question from Dennis, Stanley advised that parking and access issues have not been finalized.

Freytag expressed his opinion that this location would be an appropriate site for the garden and that there is adequate parking on the site to accommodate visitors to the garden and for Park and Recreation employees and associated business traffic.

Bill Kessloff informed the Commission that consideration is being given to the relocation of the Korean War Memorial.

A brief discussion followed regarding parking and pedestrian traffic.

Rom expressed that because due to the history of the area and people living there in the past, archeology comes into play, along with potential effects to the historical architecture and that he would like to see professional reports brought in for the Commission to review and really know what's out there.

Baumgartner explained that he had some issues with historic sites and approaches to sculptures. Palmer explained because the Park is not listed, under State Law it is not considered historic. She added that the State has advised that the Commission can do a courtesy review of the project but that the request does not need to be submitted to the State for review. Additional discussion followed.

Dennis was curious why the site of the project is so close to the building and suggested that perhaps the west-end of the Park, where the old Pap Madison Cabin used to be, could be used. Stanley stated that this was something they could take a look at, but one reason for the current location was to take advantage of the relatively close parking, the large sidewalk, and the proximity to another memorial.

Stanley informed the Commission that the project will be presented to the Parks and Recreation Advisory Board on February 10, 2013. He invited the Commission members to stop at his office in the Buell Building to review the project plans.

510 9th St (13CM001)

Acevedo reviewed the proposed request for the approval of the upper level floor plan. She addressed the corridors, windows, door openings and doors and noted that they have been working with Paul Porter on the project. She advised that Porter helped identify the areas of significance and stated that the biggest issue is the door heights. A brief discussion followed regarding the heights of the door frames and doors.

Palmer reviewed the previous actions of the Commission on November 2nd, 2012 as they relate to this property. Additional discussion followed.

Kessloff reminded the applicant about salvaging the unwanted materials.

Williams moved to recommend a finding that the approval of the floor plan would have no adverse effect on the historic property. The motion was seconded by Dennis and carried unanimously.

717 South Street (13RS001)

Wells reviewed the request to replace the garage and noted that the garage will be built to match the previous garage. He added that the garage will be 22 feet x 24 feet and will have similar lap siding that is on the house.

In response to a question from Dennis regarding the doors, Wells advised that the doors will probably be made of insulated aluminum. Wells advised that there will be two doors and he is unsure if they will have windows. Additional discussion followed.

Dennis expressed concern about approving the 11.1 Review without knowing what kind of siding and garage doors will be used on the garage.

Freytag suggested that the Commission approve the 11.1 Review with the exception of the doors. He added that the applicant could come back before the Commission when it is decided what kind of doors will be installed in the garage. Additional discussion followed regarding the siding, doors and windows.

Dennis moved to recommend a finding that the construction of the garage, the roof and the siding will have no adverse effect on the historic property and that the approval of the doors be continued until the applicant can provide the Commission with specific details for the doors and windows. The motion was seconded by Freytag and carried unanimously.

Approval of Minutes

Williams moved to approve the January 4, 2013 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Knox and carried unanimously.

New Business

New wording from Shari Thorne in Brookings on HPC Residency

Dennis reviewed the proposed revision sponsored by the City of Brookings about residency for members of Historic Preservation Commissions and added that several communities expressed concern with the proposed revision. She noted that the proposed revision has been changed to delete "shall reside within the jurisdiction of the county or municipality establishing the commission and" and to add "Residency requirements shall be as specified by the governing body".

Freytag moved to support the revised proposed legislation as it relates to Historic Preservation Commission residency. The motion was seconded by Shelton and carried unanimously.

Black Hills Home Show (March 22-24, 2013)

Palmer asked the Commission what equipment that they want for the booth at the Home Show. Baumgartner briefly reviewed the information that is available in the Commission's booth at the Home Show and informed the Commission that the booth needs to have representation in it during the entire Home Show. A brief discussion followed regarding equipment and information that should be available at the Home Show.

Dennis moved to authorize staff to order the same equipment for the Home Show that was ordered last year. The motion was seconded by Knox and carried unanimously.

Dennis moved to authorize staff to visit with Kate Nelson, Preserve South Dakota, about sharing and manning the booth at the Home Show. The motion was seconded by Williams and carried unanimously.

National Alliance of Preservation Commissions

Palmer inquired as to whether the Commission wants to renew the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions membership. A brief discussion followed.

Dennis moved that the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions membership not be renewed. The motion was seconded by Freytag and carried unanimously.

Old Business

920 St. James

Palmer reviewed the State's comments regarding the 11.1 Review for 920 St. James. She added that the appeal for the 11.1 Review will be on the Legal and Finance Committee Agenda for January 30, 2013 at 12:30 p.m. A lengthy discussion followed.

Reschedule January 16, 2013 Training Session

Palmer asked the Commission when they would like to reschedule the training session that was cancelled on January 16, 2013. A brief discussion followed and it was determined that the training session be scheduled for February 6, 2013 from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. Baumgartner asked that an item be added to the agenda to discuss the Commission's recourse for violators of the ordinance.

Dennis moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:25 a.m. The motion was seconded by Knox and carried unanimously.