

Minutes of the August 5, 2011
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Members Present: Pat Roseland, Cynthia Matson, Shawn Krull, Scott Sogge, Eric James and Duane Baumgartner

Members Absent: Jean Kessloff, Richard Grable, Tamara Pier and Heather C. Knox

Others Present: Michelle Dennis, Richard Peter, Karen Bulman, Jeanne Nicholson, Mike Stanley, Jack Batchelder, Jim Wilber, Julie Wilber and Claudia Laws

Roseland called the meeting to order at 7:31 a.m.

Approval of Meeting Agenda

James moved to approve the revised agenda. The motion was seconded by Krull. The motion was approved unanimously.

11.1 Reviews

1421 West Boulevard (11RS025)

Batchelder reviewed the proposed request to partially demolish and reconstruct the garage and explained that the garage was damaged by a construction vehicle.

James moved to recommend a finding that the partial demolition and the reconstruction of the garage will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 1421 West Boulevard. The motion was seconded by Matson.

Batchelder briefly explained what materials will be used for the foundation, siding and shingles and noted that the addition was not damaged. He added that the shed roof will have a slight slope.

In response to a question from Sogge regarding a gabled roof, Batchelder explained that he was planning on the shed roof because it would be cheaper than a gabled roof and that it would be easier for him to build the garage himself.

Sogge expressed his opinion that the original roof was gabled and a gabled roof would be more historic and because the structure is located in the Historic District, the garage should be rebuilt the same as it was before it was damaged.

Krull also expressed his opinion that the structure should be replaced with the same kind of structure that previously existed. Discussion followed.

Krull made a substitute motion to recommend a finding that the partial demolition and the reconstruction of the garage will have no adverse effect on the historic property located at 1421 West Boulevard and that the reconstructed garage have a gabled roof with a minimum 6/12 pitch. The motion was seconded by Sogge.

Additional discussion followed.

Roseland asked the applicant if he would be available to provide cost estimates for a gabled roof at the next meeting on August 19, 2011.

Krull informed the applicant that Knechts or Dakota Craft would be able to provide him with the costs for a gabled roof.

Batchelder advised that he would be available to attend a future meeting.

James made a substitute motion to continue the partial demolition and reconstruction of the garage at 1421 West Boulevard to the August 19, 2011 meeting. The motion was seconded by Sogge and the motion carried unanimously.

1319 12th Street (11RS026)

Peter reviewed the proposed request to replace the wood shakes with an asphalt roof.

Sogge moved to recommend a finding that replacing wood shakes with an asphalt roof will have no adverse effect on historic property located at 1319 12th Street. The motion was seconded by Matson and the motion carried unanimously.

502 Main Street (11CM031)

Dennis reviewed the proposed request to change the metal courtyard railing and noted that the owner would like the railing changed to better reflect the business that will be located on the property. Dennis added that because of the grade, sandstone blocks will be used along the sidewalk to ensure that the railing will be level.

Krull moved to recommend a finding that changing the metal courtyard railing will have no adverse effect on historic property located 502 Main Street. The motion was seconded by Matson and the motion carried unanimously.

1123 Fulton Street (11RS027)

Jim Wilber reviewed the proposed request to replace the wood railing and steps and to extend the railing across the porch. He added that the house has been sold and that a condition of the sale is to replace the railing and steps. Wilber also indicated his request to extend the railing across the porch is to bring the house into compliance with the building code. A brief discussion followed.

James moved to recommend a finding that replacing the wood railing and steps and extending the railing across the porch will have no adverse effect on historic property located at 1123 Fulton Street. The motion was seconded by Matson.

In response to a question from Bulman, Jim Wilber advised that the new steps and railing will be made of wood.

The motion to recommend a finding that replacing the wood railing and steps and extending the railing across the porch will have no adverse effect on historic property located at 1123 Fulton Street carried unanimously.

Approval of Minutes

Krull moved to approve the July 15, 2011 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Baumgartner and approved unanimously.

Other Business

Sogge expressed his opinion that it is not the responsibility of the Commission to determine if the Commission's recommendation is economically feasible for the 11.1 Reviews. Additional discussion followed.

In response to a question from Roseland, Bulman explained that the City Attorney is currently reviewing the contract between the City of Rapid City and Winter and Company for the next phase of the Design Guidelines. She added that when the final outline is received, staff will send a copy to the Commission members and post the outline on the City's website.

In response to a question from Matson, Bulman reported that the State concurred with the Commission's recommendations for the Adelstein requests at the corner of West Street and St. Joseph Street and that the State has requested that one case report encompassing all properties be provided for further review. A brief discussion followed.

Baumgartner moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:11 a.m. The motion was seconded by Sogge and approved unanimously.