

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
May 7, 2010

MEMBERS PRESENT: Scott Sogge, Pat Roseland, Jean Kessloff, Richard Grable, Tamara Pier, Cynthia Matson, Duane Baumgartner, John Wagner

OTHERS PRESENT: Tom Poloncic, Troy Erickson, Rodney Johansen, David Ziebarth, Tim Linde, Carrie Linde, Michelle Dennis, Marcia Elkins, Karen Bulman, Sharlene Mitchell

Call To Order

Roseland called the meeting to order at 7:33 a.m.

Approval of Meeting Agenda

The following items were added to the agenda:

- New Business - Downtown Historic Information Signs
- New Business - Peter Schmidt Window

Sogge moved, Baumgartner seconded and carried unanimously to approve the meeting agenda as amended.

Formal Action on Historic Preservation Commission Bylaws

Wagner voiced his objection to the elimination of the ex officio members and proposed amending the language to clarify that the position is "non-voting". Wagner stated that the ex officio positions are not inappropriate and should be maintained.

Baumgartner stated that the past ex officio position have been non-voting. In response to a question, Elkins indicated that the Commission has appointed Kessloff, Thurston and Swedlund as ex officio members. Discussion followed regarding the manner in which subcommittees can be utilized to obtain expert advice from non-members.

Pier addressed her experience with ex officio positions noting that the current policy does not identify the standards and term expected of the position. Discussion continued.

Matson moved, Grable seconded and carried with Sogge, Roseland, Grable, Pier, Matson, Baumgartner voting Yes and Kessloff and Wagner voting No.

Elkins advised that the Bylaws will be forwarded to the June 2, 2010 Legal and Finance Committee and the June 7, 2010 City Council for final approval.

623 St Joseph Street (10CM016)

Poloncic presented the request to repair the rear stairs utilizing the same footprint and wood materials. Poloncic indicated that the repair proposal has been amended due to the cost to install metal stairs.

Kessloff indicated that she would abstain from the vote due to a conflict of interest.

In response to a question from Wagner, Poloncic indicated that repairing the stairs utilizing the same footprint and materials is termed maintenance and does not require an upgrade to the current Code requirements.

Baumgartner moved, Sogge seconded and carried with Kessloff abstaining to recommend a finding that the repair of the existing stairs utilizing the same footprint and materials on the building located at 623 St Joseph Street will have no adverse effect on historic property.

1002 West Main Street (10CM017)

Erickson presented the request to demolish the gas station building noting the deteriorated status of the building. Erickson indicated that the billboard will also be removed to accommodate changes in the business conducted at the site.

Kessloff addressed the style and design of the structure noting that porcelain enamel steel plates were normally utilized during this time period. Kessloff indicated that the structure represents an element of the City's history and recommended a finding of adverse effect. In response to a question from Matson, Kessloff indicated that the structure is unclassified due to its location within the environs of an individually listed property.

In response to a question from Matson, Elkins stated that the Memorandum of Joint Powers Agreement stipulates that demolition of an historic property or contributing structure requires a finding of adverse effect.

Wagner moved to recommend a finding of adverse effect. Duane seconded the motion.

In response to a question from Erickson, Elkins briefly reviewed the process involved in a finding of adverse effect. Discussion followed regarding the extent of the environs boundary on the subject property. Kessloff stated that old buildings can be rehabilitated into a viable new use.

In response to a question from Pier, Erickson indicated that if the demolition is permitted he would allow any historic elements of the structure to be salvaged.

Baumgartner offered a friendly amendment to the motion to require that should the demolition be permitted the applicant provide a photographic documentation of the structure and allow the structure to be inspected for historic elements for salvage. Wagner accepted the friendly amendment.

The motion to recommend a finding that the demolition of the gas station structure located at 1002 West Main Street will have an adverse effect on historic property with the understanding that the applicant will provide photographic documentation of the structure and allow salvage of any porcelain enamel panels carried unanimously.

1515 West Boulevard (10RS007)

Ziebarth presented the request to repair the flooring, railings, stairs and columns of the rear deck noting the existing damage and deterioration of the structure. Ziebarth indicated that the rear deck was added to the property after 1996. Ziebarth indicated that Trex material will be utilized to repair and replicate the back porch.

Sogge moved to recommend a finding that the repair and replication of the back porch flooring, railings, stairs and columns on the property located at 1515 West Boulevard will have no adverse effect on historic property. Matson seconded the motion.

Kessloff encouraged the use of wood materials noting her concern for the use of Trex materials on an historic home. Discussion followed regarding the appearance of Trex and the utilization of Trex on the original City Hall building. In response to a question from Wagner, Sogge indicated that Trex can be cut like wood.

Kessloff requested that a physical sample of the materials to be used be included in future applications.

The motion to recommend a finding that the repair and replication of the back porch flooring, railings, stairs and columns on the property located at 1515 West Boulevard will have no adverse effect on historic property carried with Kessloff voting No.

820 South Street (10RS006)

C. Linde presented the request to demolish the “chicken coop” structure noting that this is a non-contributing structure added to the Carriage House. T. Linde addressed the work being performed on the two contributing structures noting that the “chicken coop” was moved onto the property at a later date. T. Linde indicated that contractors have declined to work on the structure due to its deteriorated condition. T. Linde indicated that removal of the structure would benefit the restoration of the Carriage House.

T. Linde indicated that Chris Nelson has inspected the structure noting that according to Nelson the “chicken coop” is not identified on the nomination survey. T. Linde indicated that the “chicken coop” needs to be removed to permit completion of the Carriage House residing, noting that the opening from the Carriage House to the “chicken coop” will be closed. T. Linde commented on the need to focus their financial resources on the contributing structures.

Kessloff indicated that the 1923 Sandborn maps reflect the “chicken coop” and recommended a finding of adverse effect. Discussion followed regarding the design of the structure and the ongoing erosion of the dirt floor as a result of improper drainage.

In response to a question from Wagner, T. Linde addressed the impact the drainage issue is having on both the “chicken coop” and Carriage House foundations noting the landscaping alterations that will be utilized to correct the problem.

Sogge moved, Wagner seconded and carried unanimously to recommend a finding that the demolition of the ““chicken coop”” structure located at 820 South Street will have an adverse effect on historic property with the understanding that the applicant has explored all feasible and prudent alternatives to the demolition.

820 South Street (10RS007)

T. Linde presented the request to rebuild the front porch and replace the second floor balcony. T. Linde clarified the work performed to date noting that for stability purposes the deck flooring will be a two inch tongue and groove. T. Linde indicated that the porch columns have been taken down for repainting and repair of the crowns and bases. T. Linde indicated that the second floor balcony will be replaced to its original size and design.

T. Linde addressed the use of concrete for the front steps for maintenance purposes and the addition of the light columns at the base of the stairs.

Kessloff suggested that the light fixtures would introduce a non-original element. In response to a question from Kessloff, Dennis indicated that she understood the reason for the concrete stairs noting that there are examples of concrete stairs from this period. Dennis voiced support for the wider decking noting that it would provide better stability. Dennis indicated that the stair railing design is acceptable and suggested looking at alternatives to the lighted columns.

Sogge indicated that a wood riser could be installed on the concrete stairs to give a wood appearance from the street view. Discussion followed regarding alternatives to the lighted column design and the existing lighting available on the porch.

In response to a question, T. Linde indicated that the columns would be fabricated from concrete and colored to match the sandstone. Dennis indicated that the fabricated stone would be an acceptable material.

Grable left the meeting at this time 8:40 a.m.

Discussion followed regarding allowing the applicant to resubmit the stair and lighted column design at a later date.

Wagner moved, Matson seconded and carried unanimously to recommend a finding that the addition of the second floor balcony and repair of the front porch on the property located at 820 South Street will have no adverse effect on historic property with the understanding that the applicant has withdrawn the front porch stairway and lighting proposal.

Approval of Minutes

Matson moved, Pier seconded and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of the April 6, 2010 meeting.

Matson moved, Pier seconded and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of the April 16, 2010 meeting.

Treasurer's Report

Matson moved, Sogge seconded and carried unanimously to approve the Rapid City Journal billing in the amount of \$60.00 for the on-line advertisement.

Pier moved, Baumgartner seconded and carried unanimously to approve the Jean Kessloff reimbursement in the amount of \$102.11 for Preservation Month expenditures.

Yapp Workshops

Bulman addressed the need for additional volunteers to assist with the Yapp Workshops. Dennis recommended that the Commissioners volunteer to provide transportation for Yapp to meals and to provide the introduction at the start of each workshop.

Kessloff indicated that B. Kessloff will assist with the transportation to and from the Journey Museum.

Kessloff moved, Matson seconded and carried unanimously to purchase a Dining Car ticket in the amount of \$15.00 for Yapp.

Sogge and Pier volunteered to assist with the Friday workshop introductions. Matson volunteered to assist with the Saturday workshop introductions.

In response to a question, Kessloff indicated that the Dining Car event is already half sold.

Downtown Historic Information Signs

Kessloff indicated that Destination Rapid City has volunteered to clean, paint and straighten the Downtown Historic Information Signs. Kessloff indicated that Destination Rapid City has requested that the Historic Preservation Commission provide the funding to replace the Plexiglas covers.

Baumgartner moved, Pier seconded and carried unanimously to purchase new Plexiglas for the Downtown Historic Information signs utilizing the maintenance fund account in an amount not to exceed \$1,200.00

In response to a request from Kessloff, the Commission requested that a letter of thanks be sent to Destination Rapid City for their work on the Downtown Historic Information signs.

Peter Schmidt Window

Matson moved, Baumgartner seconded and carried unanimously to request that staff submit the Schmidt Window for surplus action and research the possibility of donating the window to Habitat for Humanity.

Other Business

In response to a question from Dennis, Baumgartner indicated that the Pennington County Fair Board has been advised that the nomination project has been postponed.

Pier moved, Baumgartner seconded and carried unanimously to send a letter of thanks to Bill Kessloff for his work as an ex officio member and encourage him to consider seeking appointment to the Commission.

Wagner recommended that the 11.1 Review process be explained at the start of each meeting to insure that all applicants receive a clear understanding of the process.

Adjourn

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 8:58 a.m.