

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
April 17, 2009

MEMBERS PRESENT: Scott Sogge, Jean Kessloff, Ken Loeschke, Duane Baumgartner, Mike Bender, John Wagner, Pat Roseland

OTHERS PRESENT: Phil Hunter, Peter Schmid, Kara Paintner, Michelle Dennis, Karen Bulman, Sharlene Mitchell

Call to Order

Loeschke called the meeting to order at 7:32 a.m. and requested that the following item be added to the agenda: Norman Nelson Discussion.

1209 West Boulevard (09RS009)

Hunter presented the request to construct a 20 foot by 24 foot detached garage noting the location, size and design of the proposed structure. Hunter indicated that the existing carport would be demolished. In response to a question from Baumgartner, Hunter indicated that the carport had been constructed in 1972.

In response to a question from Wagner, Hunter indicated that a variance has been submitted for the side yard setbacks. In response to a question, Hunter indicated that due to the lot sizes in the area the requested setback is not unusual.

Discussion followed regarding the siding material and the width of the siding reveal. Wagner voiced the Commission's strong objections to the use of vinyl siding within the Historic District boundaries. Discussion continued regarding the location and design of the garage windows. Hunter indicated that the garage window design would match the window design on the front of the house.

Baumgartner moved, Roseland seconded and carried unanimously to recommend a finding that the construction of a 20 foot x 24 foot detached garage on the property at 1209 West Boulevard will have no adverse impact on historic property with the following stipulations:

1. That vinyl siding not be utilized on the garage structure;
2. That the siding reveal be 3 ½ inches or less;
3. That the design of the garage windows reflect the design of the house windows;
4. That there be no more than two windows, appropriately spaced, and a pedestrian door on the east elevation; and,
5. That there be no more than two windows, appropriately spaced, on the north elevation.

Roseland moved, Sogge seconded and carried unanimously to recommend a finding that the demolition of the non-contributing carport on the property at 1209 West Boulevard will have no adverse impact on historic property.

913 Fairview

Paintner presented the proposed detached garage and green house design and reviewed the side yard setbacks and the visibility of the structure from the front property line. In response to a question, Paintner indicated that the vinyl sided addition and dormers were constructed in 1995.

Discussion followed regarding modification of the green house roof design, modification of the existing shed for use as a green house and the style and scale of the garage windows. In response to a question from Bender, Dennis indicated that the intent is not to make the garage structure look historic noting that windows are available that will provide the natural light needs while providing a more appropriate appearing structure. In response to a question from Bender, Paintner indicated that the final design plans would be presented for Commission review at the May 15, 2009 meeting.

1819 West Boulevard (09RS003)

Bender reviewed the window designs provided by Viall for the kitchen transom window. Discussion followed regarding the change in design and size of various windows in the addition and the original structure and the resulting loss of historic integrity. Schmid questioned the need for a permit to replace windows as it was his understanding that a permit was not required for maintenance work. Bender indicated that the contractor should be aware that any change in the size of the window opening requires a building permit.

Loeschke suggested continuing the request to allow the Commission to discuss their concerns regarding the changes that have been made to the original request with the State Office of History and City staff. In response to a question from Wagner, Bulman indicated that the new addition was the only 11.1 Review application submitted for review noting that an 11.1 Review for the changes to the original structure has not been submitted. Discussion continued.

Schmid requested that the Commission take whatever action they deemed necessary so that he could move forward with the project. Discussion followed regarding the window changes that have transacted since the April 3, 2009 meeting. Schmidt indicated that due to a previous commitment he did need to leave at this time.

Discussion followed regarding the options available to the Commission regarding the construction project at 1819 West Boulevard.

Wagner moved and Roseland seconded to recommend that the 11.1 Review for the property located at 1819 West Boulevard be tabled and to request that the Building Inspections Department consider placing a Stop Work Order on all on-site construction for failure to comply with the 11.1 Review applications on the property located at 1819 West Boulevard. Upon roll call vote the motion carried 6-1 with Bender voting no.

Approval of Minutes

Roseland moved, Baumgartner seconded and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of the March 6, 2009, March 9, 2009, April 3, 2009 and April 7, 2009 meetings.

Financial Report

Baumgartner moved, Roseland seconded and carried unanimously to approve payment of the following expenditures: \$130.50 to United Rentals for Home Show Booth equipment; \$46.60 to Copy Country for mounting of Historic District Map; \$6.00 to Sharlene Mitchell for Home Show Courtesy passes; \$102.14 to Michael Bender for Home Show display expenditures; and, \$64.51 to Jean Kessloff for Home Show display expenditures.

Norman Nelson

Loeschke noted the passing of Commission member Norman Nelson. Loeschke requested that the election of a new Vice Chairperson and recommendation for replacement to the Downtown Historic Sign Board be placed on the May 1, 2009 agenda. Bulman indicated that the Mayor would address Nelson's replacement to the Historic Study Committee.

In response to a recommendation by Kessloff, Bender moved, Roseland seconded and carried unanimously to dedicate the 2009 Historic Preservation Month to Nelson.

In response to a recommendation by Kessloff, Roseland moved, Baumgartner seconded and carried unanimously to authorize the issuance of a Norman Nelson Historic Preservation certificate.

Kessloff indicated that a memorial will be established in Nelson's name to the Sierra Club noting that Nelson is to be buried in Spearfish at a later date.

Dakota Middle School

Baumgartner addressed the Rapid City School District proposal to convert the Dakota Middle School building into office space which would include an extensive reconstruction of the auditorium area. Discussion followed regarding the Commission's ability to review or provide input on the project.

Preservation Month

Baumgartner moved, Roseland seconded and carried unanimously to issue a Historic Preservation Certificate for the Last Chance Saloon restoration project and to issue the Norman Nelson Historic Preservation Certificate to the Windsor Block restoration project.

Kessloff encouraged the Commission membership to support and attend as many of the Historic Preservation Month activities as possible.

Other Business

Baumgartner moved, Roseland seconded and carried unanimously to approve Jean Kessloff attending the Deadwood Historic Preservation Symposium, Deadwood, South Dakota, May 1-3, 2009 and to reimburse Kessloff for the registration fee and mileage.

Adjourn

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 9:32 a.m.