

Email #1 for SHPO Recommendation on Avoiding Adverse Effect

From: Nelson, Chris [<mailto:ChrisB.Nelson@state.sd.us>]
Sent: Monday, March 18, 2013 2:53 PM
To: Palmer Katherine; Porter, Paul
Subject: 1113 Fulton

Hey Katherine – Here’s recommendations on how to avoid/minimize the adverse effect:

First, this replacement windows would have been good – if the condition of the windows warranted replacement. The homeowner did a great job in selecting an appropriate replacement – but replacement does not meet Rehabilitation Standard 6 in this case. (6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.)

The replacement of the historic windows and door, along with the previous replacement of historic siding, cumulatively destroy material integrity and would make the house non-contributing. I’ve pasted a summary discussion for guidelines on material integrity from the National Park Service’s Incentives website (http://www.nps.gov/tps/tax-incentives/incentives/standards_4.htm) below to help express our concurrence with an adverse effect:

“Retaining and repairing historic material

Every effort should be made to retain and repair historic material. However, the Standards acknowledge that sometimes deterioration may be so severe that replacement is the only reasonable option. When historic features and materials are replaced with matching materials, the change in visual appearance can be minimized.

But a building’s historic character is far more than simply a visual effect. The historic character is dependent upon the building’s material integrity, that is, its surviving historic material. If too much historic material is replaced with new material during rehabilitation, the historic character of a building is inevitably lost along with its material integrity. While new material can exactly copy significant features, material integrity itself can never be re-created. The precise replication of features with new materials may produce a building that *looks like* a historic building, but without retention of historic materials, the project will not meet the Standards for Rehabilitation.”

There’s only a few options to consider in this case to first **avoid** and then second **minimize** the adverse effect

Ways to avoid the adverse effect on the windows:

1. Rehab current windows and install appropriate storms to gain energy efficiency. There are two companies that make wood storm windows. Marvin Windows, and SpencerWorks out of Lincoln, NE. One of the features of the SpencerWorks wood storm windows is that the storm glass is installed and removed from the interior of the home, leaving the wood framing in place. The screen is to the exterior of the glass. The weather stripping supplies for the meeting rails

and the top, bottom and sides of the window sashes can be acquired at any home improvement store.

Ways to avoid the adverse effect on door:

1. Repair and weather seal current door

It is difficult to minimize the adverse effect as the loss of historic windows/door along with the replacement siding will make the house non-contributing. However, the replacement windows as suggested will blend in with the remainder of the district, even on a non-contributing house, so that does minimize some of the effect on the district.

Also, here is a link to what the Standards recommend concerning windows and energy efficiency: http://www.nps.gov/hps/tps/standguide/rehab/rehab_energyeff.htm Just in case the question comes up.

That's our recommendations to the city. Let us know if there are any questions and give us a heads up if it goes to council so we can look for the 10-day notice.

Thanks,

Chris Nelson
Historic Preservation Specialist
South Dakota State Historic Preservation Office
South Dakota State Historical Society
605-773-3103
Fax 605-773-6041