

Minutes of the June 1, 2012
Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

Members Present: Pat Roseland, Jean Kessloff, Richard Grable, Duane Baumgartner, Cynthia Matson, Heather Knox, Eric James, Gavin Williams and Shawn Krull

Members Absent: Michelle Dennis

Others Present: Karen Bulman, Jeanne Nicholson, Barbara Soderlin, Hani Shafai, Pat Hall, Rich von Lührte, Brian Livingston, Tony Thornton, Tom Wuertz, Fred Thurston, Jessie Rhoden, Ken Steinken and Bonny Petersen, Council Liaison

Roseland called the meeting to order at 7:30 a.m.

Approval of Meeting Agenda

James moved to approve the meeting agenda. The motion was seconded by Matson and the motion was approved unanimously.

11.1 Reviews

1208 West Blvd (12RS013)

Jessie Rhoden from All Star Construction reviewed the proposed request to replace an existing deck and noted that the dimensions and the foot print will remain the same. He added that the deck will be constructed with redwood and will meet current building codes.

Baumgartner moved to recommend that replacing the deck will have no adverse effect on historic property. The motion was seconded by Krull and carried unanimously.

811 St. Andrew St (12RS014)

Fred Thurston thanked the Committee for not allowing the property owner to demolish the garage and thanked Barb Soderlin for the article in the Rapid City Journal. He explained that Historic Rapid City is here to help residents of the Historic District and that Mr. Robeck contacted him about the expansion of the garage. He advised that the existing garage and roof will be used except for the outer wall and that a structural beam will be constructed between the existing garage and the addition. Thurston added that the garage will be lifted and that the concrete floor will be replaced. Thurston reviewed the proposed roof line and noted that the materials used for the garage and addition will be similar to the materials of the house.

James moved to recommend a finding that an addition to the garage will have no adverse effect on historic property. The motion was seconded by Matson.

Roseland thanked Thurston for working with the applicant to find ways to add to the garage instead of demolishing the garage.

Thurston commented that Historic Rapid City is willing to work with property owners in the preservation of historic property.

The motion to recommend a finding that an addition to the garage will have no adverse effect on historic property carried unanimously.

New Business

Case Report for President's Plaza

Hani Shafai informed the Commission that the Case Report has been finalized. He added that the Commission's comments were considered and that samples for the exterior of the structure are being provided for the Commission's review. Shafai reviewed the improvements that have been made to the downtown area and the historic district. He added that the President's Plaza will not only be an enhancement but will provide new businesses in the downtown area. Shafai briefly addressed shadowing, massing, colors, setbacks and parking. Shafai reviewed the street side appearances and the proposed uses for the President's Plaza. Shafai added that the proposed structure will be approximately four stories higher than the Alex Johnson and provided aerial views of the downtown area from North Street and Skyline Drive. Shafai explained because of safety reasons, granite will be used on the main level exterior walls and that two different colors of precast concrete will be used on the remaining walls of the structure.

Roseland expressed his opinion that the proposed color scheme for the condos will closely match the Alex Johnson.

Matson expressed her opinion that the developer has done a great job and that they have taken into consideration the comments from the Commission and the public.

In response to a question from Baumgartner, Shafai explained the proposed color and material scheme for the President's Plaza.

Hall added that the back side of the parking structure will also be made of precast concrete panels and that approximately 50% of the glass from original design has been removed.

Rich von Lührte of RNL Design informed the Committee that the consultants have worked very hard to bring the historic context into the proposed structure and addressed color detail, materials, window patterns, columns and the roof line. He added that breaking the proposed structure into sections gives the structure a similar look to the rest of the downtown area.

Krull advised that he met with Shafai to discuss the case report, specifically the materials, colors, shadowing and the effort to break up the verticality of the structure. He added that the consultants and the developer have put a lot of effort into the case report and have addressed the concerns of the Commission. He expressed some concern about the proposed size of the precast concrete panels. Discussion followed.

Krull expressed his opinion that the sense of several buildings instead of one large building and the proposed color scheme will help in reducing the mass of the structure. He added that he agrees with the proposed coloring and materials.

Thurston inquired as to whether the proposed structure will comply with the Park Service standards and expressed his opinion that it is important that the standards are followed. Thurston added that the proposed structure has been improved and asked if the developer has considered flipping the structure 180 degrees so that the tower is along Fifth Street instead of Sixth Street.

Shafai stated that the consultants and the developers have considered that and because of safety concerns, they did not feel that was feasible. Shafai further explained that it would be very dangerous for both vehicular and pedestrian traffic to have deliveries being made on Fifth and St. Joseph Streets. Additional discussion followed.

In response to Thurston's comments, Shafai explained that the deliveries would primarily be made in the alley and that the intent in the future, is for the alley to be vacated except for emergencies and deliveries. Shafai also addressed the old City Hall and potential improvements to the parking lot at the corner of Fifth and Kansas City Streets.

Thurston expressed his opinion that an issue still exists about the Federal laws for Historic Districts.

James explained that the Commission needs to accept, not accept or provide no comments on the Case Report. A brief discussion followed.

James moved to agree with the revised Case Report for the President's Plaza. The motion was seconded by Matson.

Petersen commented that the City Council will more likely be willing to accept the project because of the most current changes to the colors, mass and shadowing of the structure and because the project will have the support of the Historic Preservation Commission.

The motion to agree with the revised Case Report for the President's Plaza carried with Roseland, Grable, Baumgartner, Matson, Knox, James and Williams voting yes and Kessloff voting no.

Approval of Minutes

Grable moved to approve the May 18, 2012 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Matson and carried unanimously.

Meeting Attendance

Roseland suggested that meeting attendance be discussed at the next meeting.

Matson moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:32 a.m. The motion was seconded by Williams and approved unanimously.