



# CITY OF RAPID CITY

RAPID CITY, SOUTH DAKOTA 57701

## Public Works Department Engineering Services Division

300 Sixth Street

Telephone: (605) 394-4154 FAX: (605) 355-3083

Web: [www.rcgov.org](http://www.rcgov.org)

### MEMORANDUM

TO: Rapid City Public Works Committee

FROM: Ted Johnson, Engineering Project Manager

DATE: January 26, 2012

RE: Request for Exception to Section 8.2 C of the City of Rapid City Street Design Criteria to substitute 16-inch butterfly valves in lieu of 16-inch gate valves.  
Located in the SW  $\frac{1}{4}$  SW  $\frac{1}{4}$  and S  $\frac{1}{2}$  of Section 16, and the NE  $\frac{1}{4}$  NW  $\frac{1}{4}$  and N  $\frac{1}{2}$  NE  $\frac{1}{2}$  of Section 21, T2N, R7E, B.H.M., Pennington County, SD

A request was submitted on January 20, 2012 for an exception to Section 8.2C, of the City of Rapid City Standard Specifications for Public Works Construction to substitute 16-inch butterfly valves in lieu of 16-inch gate valves in the proposed East Minnesota Street Phase 2 Water Main installation.

The City of Rapid City Standard Specifications for Public Works Projects, 2007 Edition, Section 8.2 C. Valves states "...Valves 16 inches and smaller shall be gate valves and valves 18 inches and larger shall be butterfly type or gate valves as specified on the plans or detailed specifications." The use of 16-inch gates valves has been a standard requirement of the City's since 2002 and is included in the 2002, 2004 and 2007 specifications. As such, gate valves are required for the 16-inch waterline installation in the proposed East Minnesota Street Phase 2 improvements. Additionally, large diameter butterfly valves can be difficult to operate if there is a pressure differential through the valve, are more likely to leak through the valve and have higher life cycle costs. City maintenance personnel prefer gate valves to butterfly valve due to easier operation and greater dependability.

**Staff Recommendation:** Staff recommends denial of the request to substitute 16-inch butterfly valves in lieu of 16-inch gate valves as required in Section 8.2C of the Standard Specifications for Public Works Projects.



ENGINEERING  
 LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURE  
 LAND PLANNING



**DREAM DESIGN**  
 INTERNATIONAL, INC.

CONSTRUCTION OBSERVATION  
 REAL ESTATE DEVELOPMENT  
 PROPERTY MANAGEMENT

Ted Johnson  
 Engineering Services  
 300 Sixth Street  
 Rapid City, SD 57701

In Re: Exception File No. 12EX006

Dear Mr. Johnson:

Please be advised that Dream Design International, Inc. and SSST, LLC, respectfully appeal the decision of the City of Rapid City in which the above-referenced exception was denied. The exception request was made to substitute 16" butterfly valves for 16" gate valves on the Minnesota Street Project; said request was denied.

We would, at this time, request to be placed on the agenda for the next Public Works Committee meeting.

Sincerely,  
 DREAM DESIGN INTERNATIONAL, INC.

SSST, LLC

FOR

Allan Schreier, PE  
 Project Manager

Scott Zandstra  
 Partner

**RECEIVED**

JAN 25 2012

**ENGINEERING  
 SERVICES**

2:05 PM

528 KANSAS CITY STREET, SUITE 4 ♦ RAPID CITY, SOUTH DAKOTA 57701  
 PHONE: 605.348.0538 ♦ FAX: 605.348.0545 ♦ DREAMDESIGNINC.COM

designing for a better world

**REQUEST FOR EXCEPTION TO  
RAPID CITY DESIGN STANDARD / CRITERIA / REGULATIONS**

**PROJECT** East Minnesota Street

**DATE:** 1/13/12 **SUBMITTED BY:** Dream Design International, Inc.

**PIN #:** \_\_\_\_\_ **ADDRESS:** 528 Kansas City Street, RC SD 57701

**LEGAL DESCRIPTION:** Proposed E. Minnesota Street from Elk Vale Rd to East Section lines of Section 16 and 21; Located in the SW 1/4 SW 1/4 and S 1/2 of Section 16; and NE 1/4 NW 1/4 and N 1/2 NE 1/4 of Section 21, all located in T1N, R8E, BHM, Rapid City, Pennington County, SD

**EXCEPTION REQUESTED: SECTION** 16,21 **STD / CRITERIA / REG** Standard  
(Specification 8.2.C Valves)

**DESCRIPTION OF REQUEST:** \_\_\_\_\_  
Allow 16" Butterfly valves to be substituted for 16" Gate Valves on the East Minnesota Street Project.

**JUSTIFICATION:** 16" Butterfly Valves are easier to operate as watermain pressures are balances on both sides of the operating stem. 16" Butterfly Valves are more economical to maintain and replace in the future.

**SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION:**  Yes  No

**PROPERTY OWNER'S SIGNATURE\*\*:** [Signature] **DATE:** 1-13-12

\*\*Or Agent, if previously designated by the Owner in writing.

FOR STAFF ONLY

**STAFF COMMENTS:** RC standard specification Section 8.2C states "... Values 16" and smaller shall be gate valves and values 18" and larger shall be butterfly type or gate valves as specified on the plans or detailed specifications.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Deny gate valves are required by specifications. Large diameter butterfly valves can be harder to operate, are more likely to leak and have higher life cycle costs

**REVIEWED BY:** [Signature] **DATE:** 1-18-12

**AUTHORIZATION:**

[Signature]

APPROVED

BAL  
 DENIED

**COMMUNITY PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR**

1/20/2012  
**DATE**

[Signature]

APPROVED

DENIED

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR\***

1/19/12  
**DATE**

FOX

Revised 10/2011

**FILE #:** 12EX006

**ASSOCIATED FILE#:** 104L055 08SR076  
DEV 08-957

\*Public Works Director's signature is not required for Lot Length to Width Exceptions, Ordinance No. 5232.



# CITY OF RAPID CITY

RAPID CITY, SOUTH DAKOTA 57701

---

Public Works Department  
**Engineering Services Division**

300 Sixth Street

Telephone: (605) 394-4154 FAX: (605) 355-3083

Web: [www.rcgov.org](http://www.rcgov.org)

January 20, 2012

Dream Design International, Inc.  
Al Schreier  
528 Kansas City Street, Suite 4  
Rapid City, SD 57701

Re: Exception File No. 12EX006

Dear Al Schreier:

Enclosed please find a copy of the original exception request that was filed with the assigned file number and the decision details.

In the event that an exception request is denied, the Director of Public Works or the Director of Community Planning will advise the applicant of such denial in writing. Any applicant that disputes the denial of an exception may appeal such denial. The appeal will be placed on the next Public Works Committee agenda. The City Council will have final approval of whether or not to grant an exception that has been appealed.

If you have any questions or need additional information, please contact our office at 605-394-4154.

Sincerely,

*Susan Donat*

Susan Donat  
Administrative Secretary

Enclosure



EQUAL HOUSING  
OPPORTUNITY

EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER