



CITY OF RAPID CITY

RAPID CITY, SOUTH DAKOTA 57701-2724

Growth Management Department

300 Sixth Street

Karen Bulman, Urban Planner II
Growth Management Department
city web: www.rcgov.org

Phone: 605-394-4120
Fax: 605-394-6636
e-mail: Karen.bulman@rcgov.org

MEMORANDUM

TO: Legal and Finance Committee
Rapid City Council

FROM: Karen Bulman, Planner II

DATE: May 7, 2009

RE: Request for SDCL 1-19A-11.1 Final Determination relative to the proposed installation of windows at 1819 West Boulevard located in the West Boulevard National Historic District

Attached please find a request submitted by Peter Schmid for a written determination that all feasible and prudent alternatives to the proposed installation of windows in an historic property have been pursued and if all possible planning to minimize harm to the historic property has taken place.

Peter and Micah Schmid are the owners of property located at 1819 West Boulevard (legally described as Lot 8-9; S99.7' of Lot 12-13, Block 24, West Boulevard, Section 2, T1N, R7E, BHM, Rapid City, South Dakota). They have submitted an 11.1 Historic Review request to add four windows, with altered opening sizes, to the original home. The subject property is located within the West Boulevard National Historic District. The house is classified as a "contributing structure".

On September 5, 2008, the Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission found that the request to add a new garage, dining room and deck and the construction of a new driveway from the alley on the property was not an adverse effect on historic property. On September 18, 2008, the State Historic Preservation Office concurred and found that the request was not an adverse effect on the Historic District with some design modifications agreed to by the property owner.

On April 3, 2009, the Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission found that the request to amend the original addition to the house with the installation of two small windows in the south dormer; the installation of an egress window on the west side upper floor; and the installation of two small windows in the first floor west side of the garage did not have an adverse impact on



EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

historic property. In addition, the Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission recommended that the replacement of the existing kitchen window on the original structure be continued to the April 17, 2008 meeting to allow the applicant and a Commission member to review design options for the window.

On April 17, 2009, the Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission recommended that the continued 11.1 Review for the replacement of the existing kitchen window be tabled and to requested that the Building Inspections Department consider placing a Stop Work Order on all on-site construction for failure to comply with the 11.1 Review applications on the property located at 1819 West Boulevard. The applicant had replaced three additional windows and changed the window openings on the original structure without obtaining a building permit. The Building Inspections Department did place a Stop Work Order on any work on the exterior of the original building only. Any work on the interior of the property or on the new addition was allowed to continue.

The applicant subsequently submitted an 11.1 Review to change the openings on four windows in the original structure. Three of the windows had already been installed. On May 1, 2009, the Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission found that the request for four window alterations, including the three windows that had been replaced in the original structure, was an adverse effect on historic property. The four windows included the kitchen window and three upstairs bedroom windows. On May 4, 2009, the State Historic Preservation Office concurred and found that the request was an adverse effect on the Historic District due to the cumulative loss of historic windows and the alteration of historic openings. The South Dakota Office of History has waived the requirement for the preparation of a case report due to the amount of information considered to date. The State Office noted that the change in the window openings would anticipate a change in the status of the property from "contributing" to "non-contributing".

In accordance with State Statute, the property owner is now requesting that the City Council determine that all feasible and prudent alternatives to the proposed installation of windows and changes in window openings have been pursued and that all possible planning to minimize harm to this historic property has occurred.

The attached letter from the property owner sets forth the factors they considered before concluding that the installation of four windows was necessary. Also attached are copies of the minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission meetings at which this request was discussed.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends that the City Council find that all feasible and prudent alternatives to the installation of four windows and changes in window openings at 1819 West Boulevard have been pursued and that all possible planning to minimize harm to historic property has taken place.